



NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL

MONTEREY, CALIFORNIA

THESIS

**A DIFFERENT SHADE OF BLUE:
AN EVALUATION OF THE CIVILIAN DETECTIVE
CONCEPT AND ITS IMPACT ON POLICE
CAPABILITIES**

by

David B. Green

March 2016

Thesis Co-Advisors:

Patrick Miller
Kathleen Kiernan

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE			Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188	
Public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instruction, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Washington headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington, VA 22202-4302, and to the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reduction Project (0704-0188) Washington, DC 20503.				
1. AGENCY USE ONLY (Leave blank)		2. REPORT DATE March 2016		3. REPORT TYPE AND DATES COVERED Master's thesis
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE A DIFFERENT SHADE OF BLUE: AN EVALUATION OF THE CIVILIAN DETECTIVE CONCEPT AND ITS IMPACT ON POLICE CAPABILITIES			5. FUNDING NUMBERS	
6. AUTHOR(S) David B. Green				
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, CA 93943-5000			8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER	
9. SPONSORING /MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) N/A			10. SPONSORING/ MONITORING AGENCY REPORT NUMBER	
11. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES The views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not reflect the official policy or position of the Department of Defense or the U.S. Government. IRB Protocol number ____N/A____.				
12a. DISTRIBUTION / AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited			12b. DISTRIBUTION CODE	
13. ABSTRACT (maximum 200 words) Financial distress and shrinking police candidate pools have diminished cities' abilities to protect the public. This thesis examines the manner in which cities have adapted by using civilians to perform the duties of sworn detectives—specifically, whether this practice enhances cities' contributions to public safety. Nine law enforcement organizations across the country that applied this policy were analyzed. It focused on cost implications, impacts on investigative and emergency response capabilities, job qualifications, training standards, scope of duties, and overall efficacy. Similar themes include the ability of cities to reduce costs and to achieve equivalent work output from civilian personnel. Dissimilar themes surrounded the reasons cities adopted the policy and how they trained the personnel. From the analysis, this thesis determined that the use of civilian personnel does enhance cities' contributions to public safety. This thesis also identified a need for a uniform national framework for policy adoption and for state peace officer accrediting commissions to develop guidelines for training and certification.				
14. SUBJECT TERMS civilianization, civilian investigator, civilian criminal investigator, civilian economic crimes investigator, criminal investigation officer, civilian police investigator, police investigative specialist, detective, sworn detective, civilian detective, detective work, criminal investigation, police capabilities, emergency response, homeland security, San Bernardino terrorist attack, IRC attack			15. NUMBER OF PAGES 75	
			16. PRICE CODE	
17. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF REPORT Unclassified		18. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE Unclassified		19. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF ABSTRACT Unclassified
				20. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT UU

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited

**A DIFFERENT SHADE OF BLUE:
AN EVALUATION OF THE CIVILIAN DETECTIVE CONCEPT AND ITS
IMPACT ON POLICE CAPABILITIES**

David B. Green
Lieutenant, San Bernardino Police Department, California
B.S., California Baptist University, 2000
M.A.M., University of Redlands, 2010

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

**MASTER OF ARTS IN SECURITY STUDIES
(HOMELAND SECURITY AND DEFENSE)**

from the

**NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL
March 2016**

Approved by: Patrick Miller
Thesis Co-Advisor

Kathleen Kiernan, Ed.D.
Thesis Co-Advisor

Erik Dahl
Associate Chair of Instruction
Department of National Security Affairs

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

ABSTRACT

Financial distress and shrinking police candidate pools have diminished cities' abilities to protect the public. This thesis examines the manner in which cities have adapted by using civilians to perform the duties of sworn detectives—specifically, whether this practice enhances cities' contributions to public safety. Nine law enforcement organizations across the country that applied this policy were analyzed. It focused on cost implications, impacts on investigative and emergency response capabilities, job qualifications, training standards, scope of duties, and overall efficacy. Similar themes include the ability of cities to reduce costs and to achieve equivalent work output from civilian personnel. Dissimilar themes surrounded the reasons cities adopted the policy and how they trained the personnel. From the analysis, this thesis determined that the use of civilian personnel does enhance cities' contributions to public safety. This thesis also identified a need for a uniform national framework for policy adoption and for state peace officer accrediting commissions to develop guidelines for training and certification.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
A.	PROBLEM SPACE	1
B.	RESEARCH PROBLEM	3
C.	METHOD	4
D.	CHAPTER OVERVIEW	6
II.	LITERATURE REVIEW	7
A.	BUDGET CONSTRAINTS.....	7
B.	PERSONNEL CONSTRAINTS	8
C.	HOMELAND SECURITY IMPLICATIONS.....	9
D.	CIVILIANS IN LAW ENFORCEMENT	11
E.	CIVILIAN DETECTIVES	12
F.	SCOPE OF DETECTIVE DUTIES	14
G.	RESEARCH GAP	14
III.	DATA COLLECTION	17
A.	POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS	17
B.	SAMPLE COLLECTION.....	18
C.	LIMITATIONS	21
IV.	ANALYSIS	23
A.	QUANTITATIVE	23
1.	Benefit/Cost	23
2.	Employee Training/Readiness Time	25
3.	Work Output	28
B.	QUALITATIVE	29
1.	Employment Qualifications.....	29
2.	Training Standards	33
3.	Investigative Capabilities	36
4.	Emergency Response Capabilities.....	38
5.	Limitations/Restrictions	39
6.	Labor Relations	40
7.	Community Relations	42
C.	FUTURE TRENDS	43

V.	FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	45
A.	FINDINGS	45
B.	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	46
C.	CONCLUSION	48
	LIST OF REFERENCES.....	49
	INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST	55

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.	Personnel Characteristics of Sample Departments	17
Table 2.	Interview Questionnaire.....	19
Table 3.	Interview Log.....	21
Table 4.	Reason for Policy Adoption.....	24
Table 5.	Top Step Monthly Salaries.....	25
Table 6.	Sworn Detective Training/Readiness Time	27
Table 7.	Civilian Detective Training/Readiness Time.....	27
Table 8.	Work Output	29
Table 9.	Minimum Educational Qualifications.....	30
Table 10.	Minimum Experience.....	31
Table 11.	Minimum Required Knowledge	32
Table 12.	Desirable Qualifications.....	33
Table 13.	Minimum Required Training.....	35
Table 14.	Additional Available Training.....	35
Table 15.	Impact on Investigative Capabilities.....	37
Table 16.	Impact on Emergency Response Capabilities.....	39
Table 17.	Sworn Labor Position toward Civilian Detectives.....	41
Table 18.	Community Position toward Civilian Detectives	42
Table 19.	Future of Civilian Detective Policy	44

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

BCA	benefit-cost analysis
CSO	community service officer
DOJ	Department of Justice
GAO	Government Accountability Office
IACP	International Association of Chiefs of Police
IRC	Inland Regional Center
LE	law enforcement
MSU	Michigan State University
NIJ	National Institute of Justice
PERF	Police Executive Research Forum
QHSR	Quadrennial Homeland Security Review

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

As homeland security has evolved, police roles have expanded to encompass a wider array of responsibilities. Meeting these responsibilities in austere fiscal environments, however, has become increasingly difficult for cities in financial distress. Rather than expanding, many cities have reduced capabilities by cutting large segments of their police personnel. This has resulted in higher crime rates and dissatisfied citizens. Making matters worse, the Government Accountability Office reports the underlying economic conditions driving these cuts will continue to exist for the next several decades.¹ In order to adapt, some cities have adopted cost-reduction policies that employ civilian personnel to perform the duties of sworn police detectives. This concept represents a profound ideological shift in how cities protect the public.

This thesis was written as an evaluation of the civilian detective policy and was designed to determine the effects of this policy on nine U.S. law enforcement organizations. Through interviews of knowledgeable spokespersons and a review of documents, this research applied quantitative and qualitative measures designed to assess each department's individual experience. It then compared those experiences in order to identify similar and dissimilar themes. To determine if employing civilians provides a cost advantage, benefit-cost analyses (BCAs) were performed using the metrics of salaries, training/readiness time, and work output. Additionally, this research analyzed employment criteria, training protocols, and scope of duties to assess if the policy is applied consistently, and to determine the adequacy of current training and certification guidelines.

The research concluded that, with the civilian detective policy, cities can achieve an average cost savings of 29 percent while maintaining or enhancing various capabilities. The research also determined some cities are using the policy to find better-skilled employees by recruiting from larger candidate pools than those available for

¹ Government Accountability Office, *State and Local Governments' Fiscal Outlook: 2014 Update* (GAO-15-224SP) (Washington, DC: Government Accountability Office, 2014), 1–2, <http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-15-224SP>.

sworn positions. While the benefits of this policy appear substantial, the research also discovered an absence of national uniformity needed to guide cities in their research and adoption. This void has resulted in inconsistent training standards, lack of professional certification, and uncertainty on the part of officials responsible for policy implementation. The research also indicated that civilian detectives lack the public recognition and legitimacy of sworn law enforcement professionals, whose roles are better known.

One of the barriers to this policy's wider adoption is the absence of a uniform national framework that outlines the role and scope of civilian detective duties. Until a uniform national framework is published by a credible authority, cities utilizing civilian detectives will risk continued misunderstanding and personnel underutilization. Additionally, cities that have not adopted this policy will be less apt to do so while the concept is mired in ambiguity. Civilian detectives cannot perform arrests or other duties deemed physically dangerous; data describing how often these duties are needed for detective work is largely non-existent, making it difficult for cities to perform accurate BCAs. Additionally, there are no uniform guidelines regulating the training or certification of civilian detectives.

Detectives make up approximately 15 percent of the nation's 765,000 sworn law enforcement personnel.² As a result, the savings made possible by this policy could reshape one of the largest and most expensive components of the homeland security enterprise. Given the current absence of data, uniform national framework for policy adoption, and training and certification guidelines, however, it is difficult for those savings to be realized on wider scale. As a result, this thesis provides the following recommendations:

² Jan M. Chaiken, Peter W. Greenwood, and Joan R. Petersilia, *The Criminal Investigation Process* (P-5628-1) (Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 1976), 28, <http://www.rand.org/pubs/papers/P5628-1.html>; Brian Reaves, *Census of State and Local Law Enforcement Agencies, 2008* (Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, July 2011), 1, <http://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/csllea08.pdf>.

1. Further research should be conducted to more accurately quantify the rate at which arrests and physically dangerous duties are core components of detective assignments.
2. The United States Department of Justice should sponsor and fund development of a uniform national framework for adoption of civilian detective policies. The framework should be developed by a public policy institute with credibility on public safety matters.
3. State peace officer standards and training commissions should establish standardized training and certification guidelines.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My success at NPS would not have been possible without the support of my family. Throughout this program, my wife, Kathleen, graciously assumed many of my competing responsibilities. My daughters, Olivia and Lauren, not only sacrificed the time and attention of their father, but also numerous personal activities without complaint. From the day of my acceptance, my family continuously expressed pride in my participation, and their love and support served to motivate me throughout.

I owe gratitude to San Bernardino (CA) Police Chief Jarrod Burguan for sponsoring my participation. He was the first to bring the program to my attention, and his description of its prestige served to ignite my interest. I would also like to thank Assistant United States Attorney Philip Kearney for his encouragement of research on civilian criminal investigation. His insights into the nexus between local petty crime and transnational criminal organizations enhanced my appreciation for how this topic impacts homeland security.

I owe gratitude to my thesis committee, Patrick Miller and Dr. Kathleen Kiernan. They are terrific mentors, and this thesis was made possible through their wisdom and guidance. I would also like to thank the police chiefs and associated staff members who contributed their time and insight. Without their generous assistance, this research would not have been possible.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the victims of the December 2 terrorist attack in San Bernardino. San Bernardino is my city of employment, and I never imagined my research theories would be tested by my own agency under such tragic circumstance. I can only hope the lessons drawn from this research will help to ensure their sacrifice was not in vain.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

I. INTRODUCTION

There is no more important function that a government can provide for its people than safety and security.

— *The 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review*

A. PROBLEM SPACE

Subsequent to the 9/11 attacks, police roles “have been redefined and enhanced to improve the nation’s preparedness for a wide variety of possible terrorist acts.”¹ In today’s austere fiscal environment, however, public officials are struggling to fund basic police functions. Since 2008, three California communities—Vallejo, Stockton, and San Bernardino—have declared bankruptcy under the Chapter 9 provision of the United States Bankruptcy Code.² In each case, these cities cited public safety costs as a primary contributor to insolvency.³

In September 2014, the *Orange County Register*—one of Southern California’s largest newspapers—published an article titled “Public Safety Devours City Budgets.”⁴ Citing statistics from the California State Controller’s website, the *Register* reported that while inflation rose 27 percent from years 2003 to 2013, spending on public safety rose 43 percent during that same period.⁵ This problem is compounded by the fact public safety costs consume as much as 75 percent of municipal budgets and personnel costs,

¹ Roger L. Kemp, “Homeland Security: A Local Perspective,” *Spectrum: Journal of State Government* 77, no. 2 (Spring 2004): 22.

² Martin Ives and Thad Calabrese, “Employee Benefit Financing and Municipal Bankruptcy,” *The Journal of Government Financial Management* 62, no. 1 (Spring 2013): 12.

³ Kenneth E. Noble and Kevin M. Baum, “Municipal Bankruptcies: An Overview and Recent History of Chapter 9 of the Bankruptcy Code,” *Pratt’s Journal of Bankruptcy Law* 9, no. 6 (September 2013): 513–38.

⁴ “Public Safety Devours City Budgets,” *Orange County Register*, September 14, 2014, <http://www.ocregister.com/articles/public-635037-safety-percent.html>.

⁵ “Public Safety Devours City Budgets,” *Orange County Register*.

and as much as 78 percent of police budgets.⁶ Further, compensation demands within the police labor market are escalating and candidate supply is diminishing, creating a competitive recruitment tension among departments.⁷

In order to adapt to rising costs, many financially distressed cities have cut large segments of their police personnel.⁸ Examples include a 39 percent reduction in Vallejo, 25 percent reduction in Stockton, and 29 percent reduction in San Bernardino.⁹ Media reports indicate these reductions have led to higher crime rates and greater anxiety among citizens.¹⁰ Cutting police personnel in order to balance budgets is not exclusive to bankrupt cities. According to *The 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review* (QHSR), cuts to police budgets have resulted in diminished emergency response capabilities in two thirds of the nation's largest metro regions.¹¹ Additionally, the Government Accountability Office (GAO) reports the economic conditions driving these cuts are

⁶ Leonard Matarese, "Is the Current Model for Public Safety Service Delivery Sustainable?," *Public Management* (00333611) 95, no. 8 (September 2013): 10; Jeremy M Wilson, Bernard Rostker, and Cha-Chi Fan, *Recruiting and Retaining America's Finest* (Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2010), 38, http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/monographs/2010/RAND_MG960.pdf.

⁷ Jeremy M. Wilson, "Articulating the Dynamic Police Staffing Challenge," *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management* 35, no. 2 (May 25, 2012): 327–55. doi:10.1108/13639511211230084; Jeremy M. Wilson et al., *Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium* (Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2010), Product Page, <http://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/MG959.html>; Wilson, Rostker, and Fan, *Recruiting and Retaining America's Finest*; Jeremy M. Wilson and Alexander Weiss, "Police Staffing Allocation and Managing Workload Demand: A Critical Assessment of Existing Practices," *Policing: A Journal of Policy and Practice* 8, no. 2 (June 2014), <http://search.proquest.com.libproxy.nps.edu/docview/1532703822/abstract/8748C9BF473E4D3FPQ/1?accountid=12702>.

⁸ Irma Widjojo, "Vallejo Police Hiring to Catch up with Impending Retirements," *Times Herald*, January 2, 2014, <http://www.timesheraldonline.com>; Malia Wollan, "In Stockton, Calif., Years of Unraveling, Then Bankruptcy," *New York Times*, July 18, 2012, sec. U.S., <http://www.nytimes.com>; "San Bernardino Blues: Bankrupt City Flailing amid Financial Overhaul," *Al Jazeera America*, August 31, 2014, <http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2014/8/31/bankrupt-downtownsanbernardino.html>.

⁹ Widjojo, "Vallejo Police Hiring to Catch up with Impending Retirements"; Wollan, "In Stockton, Calif., Years of Unraveling, Then Bankruptcy"; "San Bernardino Blues."

¹⁰ Irma Widjojo, "Vallejo Homicide Numbers Highest in Nearly 20 Years," *Times Herald*, January 2, 2014, <http://www.timesheraldonline.com>; John Rudolf, "Stockton's Poor Mired In Violence After Police Cuts, Recession," *Huffington Post*, March 19, 2012, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/03/18/stockton-poor-poverty-crime-california_n_1346096.html; Ian Lovett, "Crime Rises in San Bernardino after Bankruptcy," *New York Times*, January 14, 2013, sec. U.S., <http://www.nytimes.com/>.

¹¹ Department of Homeland Security, *The 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review* (Washington, DC: Department of Homeland Security, 2014), 26, <http://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/publications/qhsr/2014-QHSR.pdf>.

expected to continue hampering state and local governments for the next fifty years.¹² Civilian police agencies are an integral component of the homeland security enterprise and, as costs outpace revenues, additional cities will face financial distress.

This thesis hypothesizes cities can increase public safety capabilities and decrease costs by implementing a new service delivery model. The model incorporates civilian detectives as mid-level practitioners in police departments. The use of these personnel in policing is analogous to the medical industry's use of physician assistants and the legal industry's use of paralegals. Unlike traditional civilian personnel, these practitioners can conduct criminal investigations in much the same way as a sworn detective. They can triage and investigate criminal cases by performing the tasks that do not require arrest powers or entail physical danger. Depending on the employing agency, these personnel are known by a variety of titles indicative of their civilian status and responsibility for criminal investigation. For clarity and consistency, this thesis will refer to them throughout as civilian detectives.

While prior research has focused on civilian use for ancillary duties (such as low-level report taking and evidence processing), this research focuses on the more advanced functions of criminal investigation and case management. It specifically analyzes nine¹³ departments that have enacted policy to adopt this model, and applies specific measures in order to prove or disprove its efficacy. This research's purpose is to close existing knowledge gaps and enable city managers and police chiefs to make more informed decisions about how to best protect our nation's communities.

B. RESEARCH PROBLEM

This research sought to determine if cities can decrease costs and/or increase operational capabilities that are beneficial to policing and homeland security missions by using civilians to perform the duties of sworn detectives. It also sought to determine

¹² Government Accountability Office (GAO), *State and Local Governments' Fiscal Outlook: 2014 Update* (GAO-15-224SP) (Washington, DC: Government Accountability Office, 2014), 1–2, <http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-15-224SP>.

¹³ Costa Mesa, Huntington Beach, Placentia, Santa Ana, San Bernardino, County of Orange, Mesa, Peoria, and Sarasota.

overall efficacy and identify if adequate guidelines exist for policy adoption and implementation.

C. METHOD

This thesis was designed to conduct a policy analysis in order to determine if use of civilian detectives is effective. Sample departments were selected according to three criteria. First, all sample departments had a designated personnel classification for the role of civilian criminal investigator/detective. Second, the task of criminal investigation or case management served as the principal function described for the position. Many police departments have civilian personnel classifications for which investigative duties comprise an ancillary responsibility; this thesis focused on those that have expanded this role into the realm of what would traditionally be reserved for sworn detectives. Finally, sample departments had civilian detective positions for which job descriptions were readily accessible online.

Using these criteria, nine U.S. law enforcement departments were selected for evaluation: Costa Mesa, California; Huntington Beach, California; Placentia, California; Santa Ana, California; San Bernardino, California; County of Orange, California; Mesa, Arizona; Peoria, Arizona; and Sarasota, Florida. This research analyzed these departments' impetus for policy adoption as well as their strengths and limitations in application. As such, this thesis is formatted as a traditional policy analysis with focus on the civilian concept. In analyzing each department, benefit-cost analyses (BCAs) were conducted by weighing the alternative of sworn personnel from within the same departments using top step salaries.

Policies regarding the civilian classification of community service officers (CSOs) or similar positions were excluded from this research unless their primary duties included criminal investigation and case management. Although many CSOs perform investigative tasks, these duties are subordinate to their principal function—report taking. A second factor for exclusion is that extensive literature already exists on the CSO classification. This classification has existed for several decades and its benefits and

constraints are largely known. This research contains one exception, for the City of Huntington Beach, California, wherein civilian detectives are classified as CSOs.

This thesis compared the use of civilian and sworn detectives within each sample department. The analysis determined each department's individual experience and then compared the experiences in order to determine best practices, which have resilience and scalability. The metrics used for analysis were salaries, training/readiness time, and work output. Using these metrics as measures of effectiveness, the analysis determined if civilians could provide a cost advantage while producing an equivalent work product. In order to ensure data was relevant, only compensation rates from within the same departments were used for the purpose of comparing civilian and sworn classifications.

Instrumentation comprised compensation tables and job descriptions that specified the costs, duties, roles, purposes, procedures, and expectations of these personnel. Relevant criteria for personnel selection, training, compensation, and scope of duties were drawn from the documents and analyzed to identify similar and dissimilar characteristics in the data set. Staff interviews were also conducted to gather information not available in written form. Executive staff from selected departments were contacted by email and provided an explanation of the research, asked to participate, and asked to designate knowledgeable spokespersons. While this research was not intended to seek confidential data, each executive or designated spokesperson was asked to identify concerns with publication. The only department to express concern was Sarasota, Florida, which declined to participate in an interview due to unspecified security concerns and time constraints. During the course of research, no other concerns were encountered and all data collected during interviews was linked with its respective department. Once all appropriate and available data had been analyzed, the benefits, constraints, and gaps in knowledge were identified in order to produce a policy recommendation.

The mode of analysis was both quantitative and qualitative. Research steps included the following: 1) performing interviews of knowledgeable department spokespersons, 2) gathering documents, 3) sorting the data into matrices, 4) identifying patterns and themes, 5) developing conclusions aimed to answer the research questions, and 6) developing recommendations. The policy recommendation produced by this thesis

seeks to facilitate more informed decision-making on the part of city managers and police chiefs responsible for creating greater economy and public safety capabilities in our nation's police departments.

D. CHAPTER OVERVIEW

Following this introduction, Chapter II reviews literature relevant to the use of civilian detectives. Chapter III describes the data sources used for this research as well as the collection process and associated limitations. Chapter IV presents the data findings and relevant analysis. Chapter V summarizes those findings and offers recommendations, followed by concluding comments.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

In order to adapt to emerging economic conditions and maintain operational capacity, many police departments have sought to replace sworn personnel with less expensive civilian personnel. Literature on this concept addresses the use of civilians to perform sworn personnel's ancillary duties, but does not extensively cover the use of civilians to perform more primary duties such as criminal investigation or case management. Because this use is less common, researchers have yet to analyze the successes and failures of agencies pioneering this unorthodox approach. Additionally, literature is silent on this practice's benefits and constraints, and on best practices for implementing its integration.

This chapter reviews literature pertaining to the use of civilians for criminal investigation and case management. In order to provide context for the environmental conditions leading to their emergence, this chapter also analyzes associated literature concerning state and local budget constraints, law enforcement personnel constraints, homeland security implications, traditional civilian uses, and the scope of detective duties.

A. BUDGET CONSTRAINTS

Literature in this field explains that a downed national economy has severely impaired governments' ability to operate. A contemporary source of validation exists in a 2014 fiscal update by the United States Government Accountability Office (GAO). The report corroborates that the current economic downturn began in 2008 and asserts that, without significant policy changes, state and local governments will continue to face economic imbalances for the next fifty years.¹⁴ This condition results from an environment in which revenues exceed receipts.¹⁵

¹⁴ GAO, *State and Local Governments' Fiscal Outlook*, 1–2.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*

Ives and Calabrese acknowledge the 2008 economic downturn and expand on some of its more catastrophic effects.¹⁶ Their article “Employee Benefit Financing and Municipal Bankruptcy” chronicles three bankrupt cities and describes how employee compensation packages—primarily public safety—make up the greatest financial burdens.¹⁷ While this article describes the impact of public safety costs on three bankrupt cities, it does not explain if these spending models reflect a national trend.¹⁸ For more pervasive answers, there is literature explaining, more specifically, how economic downturn has impacted the policing industry. Authors Wilson, Weis, and Grammich; Matarese; Gascon; and Foglesong generally agree on three conditions: personnel costs constitute the majority of policing budgets, policing costs constitute the majority of municipal budgets, and policing costs have outpaced both revenues and inflation.¹⁹ The resulting cuts to public safety are corroborated by the 2014 QHSR, which asserts that spending cuts have resulted in diminished emergency response capabilities in two-thirds of the nation’s largest metro regions.²⁰

B. PERSONNEL CONSTRAINTS

Literature pertaining to recruitment and retention of sworn police personnel provides several insights ranging from the evolution of police strategies to the changing culture of society. What is most relevant to this research are the labor market forces affecting supply and demand of sworn personnel. These forces dictate the salary and benefit packages cities must offer in order to recruit and retain officers. Of the available literature, only two publications are both comprehensive and contemporary. The first is an academic article authored by Michigan State University Professor Jeremy Wilson and the second is a joint publication by RAND and the U.S. Department of Justice Office of

¹⁶ Ives and Calabrese, “Employee Benefit Financing.”

¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Jeremy M Wilson, Alexander Weis, and Clifford Grammich, “Public Safety Consolidation: What Is It? How Does It Work?,” *BOLO Be on the Lookout*, no. 2 (August 2012): 12; Matarese, “Is the Current Model for Public Safety Service Delivery Sustainable?”; George Gascon, Todd Foglesong, and National Institute of Justice, *Making Policing More Affordable: Managing Costs and Measuring Value in Policing* (Rochester, NY: Scholar’s Choice, 2015).

²⁰ Department of Homeland Security, *The 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review*, 26.

Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS), authored by Wilson, Weis, and Grammich.²¹ Both cite the expansion of community policing and homeland security responsibilities as significant contributors to the increase in demand for police officers.²² They also agree the applicant pool for police positions is shrinking due to the changing career preferences of today's generation of candidates.²³ While silent on the shortage of applicants, a 2012 Department of Justice (DOJ) report provides indirect evidence of recruitment tensions, citing that 57 percent of the nation's law enforcement agencies offer financial incentives to new recruits.²⁴

C. HOMELAND SECURITY IMPLICATIONS

Since 9/11, the nation has come to recognize that police play a major role in responding to terror attacks.²⁵ Of equal importance is their ability to quickly initiate investigations in order to prevent further attacks, while simultaneously gathering evidence to identify, apprehend, and prosecute suspects. These investigative demands gained wider recognition after the terror attacks on the Boston Marathon and San Bernardino's Inland Regional Center (IRC), where police accomplished these tasks in a rather short period of time.²⁶ The 2014 QHSR supports this notion, describing how reductions in public safety personnel have diminished the nation's emergency response

²¹ Wilson, "Articulating the Dynamic Police Staffing Challenge"; Wilson et al., *Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium*.

²² Wilson, "Articulating the Dynamic Police Staffing Challenge," 331; Wilson et al., *Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium*, 20–21.

²³ Wilson, "Articulating the Dynamic Police Staffing Challenge," 335; Wilson et al., *Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium*, 7.

²⁴ Brian Reaves, *Hiring and Retention of State and Local Law Enforcement Officers, 2008—Statistical Tables* (Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, October 2012), 12, <http://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf>.

²⁵ *The 9/11 Commission Report: Final Report of the National Commission on Terrorist Attacks Upon the United States* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2011), 282, 291, 302.

²⁶ Dutch Leonard and Arnold M. Howitt, *Preliminary Thoughts and Observation on the Boston Marathon Bombings* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, 2013), <http://www.hbs.edu/faculty/Pages/item.aspx?num=46718>; Greg Botelho and Ralph Ellis, "San Bernardino Attack Investigated as Act of Terrorism," *CNN*, December 5, 2015, <http://www.cnn.com/2015/12/04/us/san-bernardino-shooting/index.html>; Joel Achenbach and Sari Horwitz, "Before the Final Shootout, Four Mysterious Hours in San Bernardino," *Washington Post*, December 14, 2015, <https://www.washingtonpost.com>.

capabilities.²⁷ However, the report relies on the reader's agreement with this conclusion despite offering no additional evidence to support the nexus between police and homeland security.

In an article on police-fire consolidation, Matarese and his co-authors assert that today's law enforcement personnel bear responsibility for both preventing and responding to terrorist attacks.²⁸ Much like the QHSR, the Matarese article asserts this point as common knowledge without offering further evidence.²⁹ The article uses this assertion to support its argument for the benefits of police-fire consolidation.³⁰ This nexus is also supported by literature on police recruitment and retention, which asserts that homeland security functions have added to the demand side of the labor market equation for sworn police personnel.³¹

While not as specific to law enforcement as the previously mentioned publications, Presidential Directives HSPD-5 and HSPD-8 both ascribe homeland security responsibilities to local governments.³² Other literature asserting law enforcement's role in homeland security ranges from articles describing intelligence-led policing³³ to those discussing transnational crime and its relation to terror financing.³⁴ The notion that police are responsible for homeland security is treated by most authors as common knowledge, with very few offering specific supporting evidence. One exception can be found in Rayner's 2014 doctoral dissertation on detective work. In describing the contemporary detective's role, he specifically describes counterterrorism investigation as

²⁷ Department of Homeland Security, *The 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review*, 26.

²⁸ Leonard Matarese et al., "Public Safety Concept in the Post-9/11 World," *Public Management* (00333611) 89, no. 4 (May 2007): 14–17.

²⁹ Matarese et al., "Public Safety Concept in the Post-9/11 World."

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Wilson, "Articulating the Dynamic Police Staffing Challenge."

³² The White House, *Management of Domestic Incidents* (HSPD-5) (Washington, DC: The White House, 2003), <http://fas.org/irp/offdocs/nspd/hspd-5.html>; The White House, *National Preparedness* (HSPD-8) (Washington, DC: The White House, 2003), <http://fas.org/irp/offdocs/nspd/hspd-8.html>.

³³ Lonnie M. Schaible and James Sheffield, "Intelligence-led Policing and Change in State Law Enforcement Agencies," *Policing* 35, no. 4 (2012): 761–84, doi: 10.1108/13639511211275643.

³⁴ Peter Katel, "Transnational Crime," *CQ Researcher by CQ Press*, 24, no. 30 (August 2014): 697–720.

a newly adopted responsibility and describes that 25 percent of surveyed police departments have personnel assigned to this function.³⁵ This data supports the notion that improving police departments' investigative capabilities also serves to improve the greater homeland security mission.

D. CIVILIANS IN LAW ENFORCEMENT

Literature on civilian use in law enforcement is not new, but has become more prevalent since the 2008 economic downturn. The most notable aspect of this trend is the volume of government reports, which tend to acknowledge economic pressures as the driver for interest in this topic.³⁶ Industry think tanks such as the Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) have also published on this topic with a report assessing the 2009 Byrne Civilian Hiring Program.³⁷ Founded in 1976, PERF specializes in advanced police research and policy development and is widely recognized for its contributions to the law enforcement profession.³⁸

Among academic contributors, Dr. Jeremy Wilson of Michigan State University's (MSU) School of Criminal Justice has been of the more authoritative. He founded and directs MSU's Center for Anti-Counterfeiting and Product Protection as well as their Police Consolidation and Shared Services Program.³⁹ In recent years, he has worked with

³⁵ Jeremiah Rayner, "Re-Evaluating the Criminal Investigative Process: An Empirical Evaluation of Criminal Investigations in the United States" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Southern Mississippi, 2014), 59, <http://aquila.usm.edu/dissertations/3>.

³⁶ Office of the City Auditor, *Audit of Civilianization Opportunities in the San Jose Police Department* (San Jose, CA: City of San Jose, January 2010), <http://www.sanjoseca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/3227>; Police Executive Research Forum, *Organizational Assessment of the San Francisco Police Department: A Technical Report* (San Francisco, CA: Police Executive Research Forum, December 2008), <http://www.sf-police.org/Modules/ShowDocument.aspx?documentid=14694>; Office of the Inspector General: City of Chicago, *Review of Opportunities for Civilianization in the Chicago Police Department* (Chicago, IL: Office of the Inspector General, January 2013), <http://chicagoinspectorgeneral.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/01/IGO-Opportunities-for-Civilianization-within-CPD-Final-1-23-13.pdf>; Curt Griffiths and Nahanni Pollard, *Policing in Winnipeg: An Operational Review* (Ottawa, ON: Canadian Police Association, October 2013), <http://curtgriffiths.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/WPS-operational-review.pdf>.

³⁷ Robert C. Davis et al., *Civilian Staff in Policing: An Assessment of the 2009 Byrne Civilian Hiring Program* (NCJ 246952) (Washington, DC: National Institute of Justice, December 2013), <https://www.ncjrs.gov/app/publications/abstract.aspx?id=269042>.

³⁸ "About PERF," Police Executive Research Forum, accessed August 24, 2015, <http://www.policeforum.org/>.

³⁹ "About," Jeremy M. Wilson, Ph.D., accessed August 24, 2015, <http://www.jeremywilson.org/users/jeremy-wilson>.

RAND and the U.S. Department of Justice COPS Office to produce comprehensive work on law enforcement recruiting, staffing, and deployment modeling. His work supports the notion that competitive tensions in recruitment are growing among the nation's police departments. One of his more recent contributions to the topic of civilianization is a joint publication with Dr. William King of Sam Houston University, which proposes a six-part framework for helping police departments assess the viability of civilian integration within their agencies.⁴⁰

While literature has been published by a wide variety of government, think tank, and academic sources, its content has paid little attention to the task of criminal investigation. Rather, these sources focus more narrowly on ancillary policing duties such as forensic investigation, victim services, crime trend analysis, and various liaising responsibilities.⁴¹ A fundamental difference can be noted between academic and government literature in that academic literature tends to focus on concepts and potential for further applications while government literature tends to focus on cost-saving benefits for various jurisdictions. Government literature is also generally more specific in the roles for which civilian use is advocated.⁴²

E. CIVILIAN DETECTIVES

Literature on the use of civilian detectives is primarily limited to reports by large city governments and think tanks. Of these reports, only one directly advocates this concept.⁴³ A significant aspect of this report is that it was published by PERF, which is highly respected within the law enforcement profession. The report is also significant because it advocates this concept for the City of San Francisco, which has the nineteenth

⁴⁰ William R. King and Jeremy Wilson, *Integrating Civilian Staff into Police Agencies* (Washington, DC: Office of Community Oriented Policing Services, December 2014), 11.

⁴¹ King and Wilson, *Integrating Civilian Staff into Police Agencies*; Megan Alderden and Wesley G. Skogan, "The Place of Civilians in Policing," *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management* 37, no. 2 (2014): 259–84, doi: 10.1108/PIJPSM-12-2012-0073.

⁴² Office of the City Auditor, *Audit of Civilianization Opportunities in the San Jose Police Department*; Police Executive Research Forum, *Organizational Assessment*; Office of the Inspector General: City of Chicago, *Review of Opportunities*; Griffiths and Pollard, *Policing in Winnipeg*.

⁴³ Police Executive Research Forum, *Organizational Assessment*.

largest municipal police department in the nation.⁴⁴ Other reports, such as one authored by the San Jose City Auditor, offer interest in the idea while calling for more research.⁴⁵ Within the literature, however, a third position emerges; a Chicago Inspector General report offers that civilians cannot possess the knowledge or experience to perform regular criminal investigations.⁴⁶ Of these three publications, there is absolute lack of consensus. Only the PERF report directly advocates the use of civilians for criminal investigation, and only in an assisting role to sworn detectives.⁴⁷ What is notable is that not a single publication advocates the use of civilians as lead investigators or offers analysis of departments utilizing civilians in this role.

In a related publication by the National Institute of Justice, authors Gascon and Foglesong advocate new thinking toward the use of civilians.⁴⁸ Although their article avoids specifically discussing criminal investigation, it advocates a profound reinvention of law enforcement through the use of paraprofessionals.⁴⁹ It suggests that the use of civilians to achieve economy and bolster capabilities can be achieved in law enforcement the same way it has been in medicine through the use of physician assistants.⁵⁰ Among the few academics to contribute to this topic, Liederbach, Fritsch, and Womack state, “The goal of the movement is increased efficiency—to relieve sworn detectives of the more mundane cases so that they can devote more time to solving felony crimes.”⁵¹ While the authors acknowledge the emergence of civilian detectives in three municipal police departments, they offer no assessment of the civilians’ performance in that role.⁵²

⁴⁴ Ibid.; Brian Reaves, *Census of State and Local Law Enforcement Agencies, 2008* (Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, July 2011), 17, <http://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/csllea08.pdf>.

⁴⁵ Office of the City Auditor, *Audit of Civilianization Opportunities in the San Jose Police Department*.

⁴⁶ Office of the Inspector General: City of Chicago, *Review of Opportunities*.

⁴⁷ Police Executive Research Forum, *Organizational Assessment*.

⁴⁸ Gascon, Foglesong, and National Institute of Justice, *Making Policing More Affordable*.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Ibid.

⁵¹ John Liederbach, Eric J. Fritsch, and Charissa L. Womack, “Detective Workload and Opportunities for Increased Productivity in Criminal Investigations,” *Police Practice & Research* 12, no. 1 (February 2011): 60, doi:10.1080/15614263.2010.497379.

⁵² Liederbach, Fritsch, and Womack, “Detective Workload and Opportunities.”

F. SCOPE OF DETECTIVE DUTIES

Literature analyzing the scope of detective duties is either limited or outdated. For decades, the seminal work on this topic was a 1976 RAND report authored by Chaiken, Greenwood, and Petersilia.⁵³ The RAND report was followed up twenty-five years later with an academic report by Horvath, Meesig, and Yung.⁵⁴ Contemporary literature is limited to a 2011 report by Liederbach, Fritsch, and Womack, and Rayner's 2014 doctoral dissertation.⁵⁵ Both offer an overview of today's detective role using real data. What is relevant to this research is the percentage of work hours detectives spent performing arrests or other duties that entail physical danger. Leiderbach et al. and Rayner both assert these duties constitute a small percentage of detective work, but do not offer specific figures defined by these criteria.⁵⁶ The Chaiken and Rayner works both indicate detectives account for between 14.5 and 16 percent of sworn police personnel, indicating the composition of police departments has remained relatively unchanged over the past four decades.⁵⁷ Although personnel composition has undergone little change, Rayner asserts that, due to the addition of counterterrorism responsibilities, further evaluation of the investigative process is warranted.⁵⁸

G. RESEARCH GAP

Today's financially austere environment requires innovative thinking on the part of state and local governments. The paraprofessional concept promoted by Gascon and Foglesong is an excellent example of innovation, particularly as it applies to civilian detectives. However, the concept requires further research in order to build a business

⁵³ Jan M. Chaiken, Peter W. Greenwood, and Joan R. Petersilia, *The Criminal Investigation Process* (P-5628-1) (Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 1976), <http://www.rand.org/pubs/papers/P5628-1.html>.

⁵⁴ Frank Horvath, Robert T. Meesig, and Yung Hyeock Lee, *National Survey of Police Policies and Practices Regarding the Criminal Investigations Process: Twenty-Five Years after Rand* (Lansing: Michigan State University, 2001).

⁵⁵ Liederbach, Fritsch, and Womack, "Detective Workload and Opportunities"; Rayner, "Re-Evaluating the Criminal Investigative Process."

⁵⁶ Liederbach, Fritsch, and Womack, "Detective Workload and Opportunities"; Rayner, "Re-Evaluating the Criminal Investigative Process."

⁵⁷ Chaiken, Greenwood, and Petersilia, *The Criminal Investigation Process*, 59; Rayner, "Re-Evaluating the Criminal Investigative Process," 28.

⁵⁸ Rayner, "Re-Evaluating the Criminal Investigative Process," 34.

case for more widespread adoption. In determining if the concept can evolve beyond a novel experiment by a limited number of departments, several questions must first be answered. For example, can these personnel be used to perform more advanced functions than their existing civilian contemporaries? Do adequate guidelines exist for hiring, training, and integrating these personnel into existing departments? To date, there is no published research that adequately addresses these questions. By answering these questions, this research seeks to help state and local governments avoid financial distress. This research closes that gap through an evaluation of departments using these personnel and a comprehensive analysis of the policy itself.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

III. DATA COLLECTION

A. POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS

Nine departments with civilian detective policies were identified and selected for research. Among those, 66 percent are located in Southern California. Through interviews, the average size of these departments was determined to be 272 sworn personnel, with civilian detectives composing an average of 10.5 percent of detective personnel (see Table 1). When classified by size, the departments were found to be a representative sample of 17 percent of the nation's police departments overall.⁵⁹ Of the selected departments, eight perform municipal policing functions and one—the Investigative Division of the Orange County District Attorney's Office—performs criminal investigations only with no emergency response function. Due to the limited number of policies available for study, this research was limited to small-*n* sampling.

Table 1. Personnel Characteristics of Sample Departments

Department	Sworn Personnel	Civilian Personnel	Sworn Detectives	Civilian Detectives
Costa Mesa PD	136	31	6	1
Huntington Beach PD	214	122	44	5
Mesa PD	819	426	170	1
Orange County DA Inv.	179	68	179	8
Peoria PD	188	101	35	2
Placentia PD	47	23	9	1
San Bernardino PD	248	173	44	11
Santa Ana PD	348	320	70	6
Sarasota PD	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown

Note: Data derived from interview responses (see Table 3).

⁵⁹ Brian A. Reaves, *Local Police Departments, 2013: Personnel, Policies, and Practices* (NCJ 248677) (Washington, DC: Bureau of Justice Statistics, 2015), 3, <http://www.bjs.gov/index.cfm?ty=pbdetail&iid=5279>.

B. SAMPLE COLLECTION

Evidence collection for this research occurred in three phases. The first phase entailed a comprehensive literature review on the topic of civilian detectives. Additionally, literature pertaining to the associated topics of budget constraints, personnel constraints, homeland security implications, the scope of detective duties, and the general use of civilians in law enforcement was reviewed. Through this review, nine departments with civilian detective policies were identified.⁶⁰ Although there was an abundance of information concerning civilian roles in law enforcement, very little concentrated on the role of criminal investigation. More specifically, there was no literature found pertaining to the benefits, constraints, and general experiences of departments that had adopted civilian detective policies.

The second phase of data collection entailed gathering job descriptions from the sample departments. Fortunately, all nine were accessible online through the cities' human resource websites. Each was downloaded, labeled by department, and saved in corresponding folders. The job descriptions were then used to extrapolate data on minimum qualifications and scope of duties. This data was sorted into matrices and coded for analysis. It was also used as the foundation for the third and final phase of collection.

The third phase entailed interviewing department representatives. This phase was initiated by contacting the department chiefs via email. The correspondence explained the purpose and scope of the research and requested an interview with the chief or his or her knowledgeable designee. All chiefs responded and expressed a willingness to participate, with the exception of the chief of Sarasota, Florida, who declined. Once responses were received, each chief or designee was sent a copy of the interview questionnaire containing the fifteen questions listed in Table 2.

⁶⁰ Costa Mesa, Huntington Beach, Placentia, Santa Ana, San Bernardino, County of Orange, Mesa, Peoria, and Sarasota.

Table 2. Interview Questionnaire

1. Can you provide personnel totals for your department's sworn, civilian, detective, and civilian detective ranks?
2. Did your department adopt a policy of using civilian detectives for the purpose of reducing costs?
3. If yes, can you state or estimate the savings in terms of a percentage or dollar figure?
4. What are your department's minimum training requirements for civilian detectives?
5. How long does it take your department to train and field a civilian detective versus a sworn detective?
6. Within the scope of their duties, have civilian detectives produced a lesser, equivalent, or greater work output/case clearance rate than sworn detectives?
7. Have your department's investigative capabilities increased, remained the same, or decreased as a result of using civilian detectives?
8. Have your department's emergency response capabilities increased, remained the same, or decreased as a result of using civilian detectives?
9. What can your civilian detectives not do that must instead be performed by a sworn detective?
10. Has your prosecutor's office placed limitations on the use of civilian detectives?
11. Has your department's sworn detective labor group supported, remained neutral, or opposed the use of civilian detectives?
12. Has your local community supported, remained neutral, or opposed the use of civilian detectives?
13. Is your department planning to reduce, maintain, or expand its use of civilian detectives?
14. Can you provide unpublished documents such as research reports, collective bargaining agreements, standard operating procedures, administrative directives, or any other documents that specify the costs, duties, roles, purposes, procedures, or expectations of civilian detectives?
15. Is there any information contained in this interview or the requested documents that your department would like excluded from, or anonymized, in this research?

Once each interview participant had received the questionnaire, appointments were scheduled for interviews by phone. Initially, a total of nine interviews were completed over a three-week period. The average length of the interviews was 27 minutes and all participants consented to having their interviews recorded. Prior to the interviews, a duplicative questionnaire was created for each participant so that typed notes could be recorded, saved, and filed by participant name. Interviews were semi-structured with follow-up and clarifying questions asked on an as-needed basis. Information gathered from the interviews was sorted into matrices and coded for analysis.

While the chiefs of eight departments agreed to participate, a total of ten interviews were completed, as listed in Table 3. During the author's interview of Mesa Police Lieutenant Stephanie Derivan, it was learned the civilian investigative specialist classification about which the author was inquiring served a role outside the scope of this research. However, Lieutenant Derivan informed the author of another Mesa Police Department classification titled civilian investigator III that met the specified research criteria. As a result, the author conducted a second interview of Mesa Police Sergeant Jodie Martinez, who was deemed knowledgeable of the department's experiences with this latter classification.

Subsequent to the research interviews, the City of San Bernardino experienced a terrorist attack on its Inland Regional Center.⁶¹ The attack, which took place on December 2, 2015, has been characterized as the most lethal on American soil since 9/11.⁶² Additionally, the San Bernardino Police Department has been credited with identifying, locating, and capturing the suspects within record time.⁶³ Due to the significance of the event on this research, the author deemed it prudent to perform a second interview of San Bernardino Police Chief Jarrod Burguan. The interview was conducted in person, recorded, and limited to questions 7 and 8 from Table 2. Both

⁶¹ Botelho and Ellis, "San Bernardino Attack Investigated as Act of Terrorism."

⁶² Peter Bergen, "The Biggest U.S. Terror Attack Since 9/11," RealClear Politics, December 5, 2015, http://www.realclearpolitics.com/2015/12/05/the_biggest_us_terror_attack_since_911_371360.html.

⁶³ Joel Rubin et al. "'All Hell Broke Loose' as Police Chased the San Bernardino Shooters," *Los Angeles Times*, December 13, 2015, <http://graphics.latimes.com/san-bernardino-chase/>.

questions were modified to address how civilian detectives impacted his department's investigative and emergency response capabilities in the days following the attack.

Table 3. Interview Log

Department	Department Representative	Interview Date
Costa Mesa PD	Chief Rob Sharpnack	July 29, 2015
Huntington Beach PD	Lieutenant John Cottriel	July 20, 2015
Mesa PD	Lieutenant Stephanie Derivan	July 25, 2015
Mesa PD	Sergeant Jodie Martinez	July 30, 2015
Orange County DA Inv.	Commander Eric Akerlind	August 3, 2015
Peoria PD	Lieutenant Anthony Wolfe	July 28, 2015
Placentia PD	Chief Ward Smith	July 27, 2015
San Bernardino PD	Chief Jarrod Burguan	August 9, 2015
San Bernardino PD	Chief Jarrod Burguan	December 16, 2015
Santa Ana PD	Chief Carlos Rojas	July 20, 2015
Sarasota PD	N/A	N/A

C. LIMITATIONS

During the course of this research, a number of limitations were identified. Key among them was that few departments have adopted civilian detective policies. This limited the research to small-*n* sampling. Additionally, no large departments of 1,000 or more officers were identified as having adopted the policy; its impact on departments of this size is therefore unknown. Another limitation related to BCAs. While several interviewees reported that sworn personnel have more costly benefit packages than civilians, information on benefit packages was either unavailable or difficult to verify. As a result, this research used top step salaries, as opposed to total compensation, as the sole metric for BCAs. Finally, data regarding the percentage of time spent by detectives performing arrests or other physically dangerous duties could not be obtained due to time constraints and limitations on the scope of this research.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

IV. ANALYSIS

A. QUANTITATIVE

1. Benefit/Cost

This research sought to determine why police departments adopt civilian detective policies (see Table 4 for a summary of related interview responses). Surprisingly, it was determined through interviews that only 22 percent of departments in the sample population had adopted the policy for the purpose of reducing costs. This figure was unexpectedly low given the findings of prior research on civilianization. The low figure may partially be attributed to the fact data was unavailable for 33 percent of the sample population. The reason for adoption could not be determined for Sarasota due to lack of participation and was unavailable for Huntington Beach and Mesa due to lack of record keeping and classification predating the careers of interviewees. Another unexpected finding was that 33 percent of departments had adopted the policy to seek skill sets largely unavailable among the sworn candidate pool. Santa Ana, which constitutes 11 percent of the population, was found to have adopted the policy as a means of promoting community policing by allowing greater numbers of community members to attain law enforcement careers.

While discussing targeted recruitment as a reason for policy adoption, some interviewees provided various anecdotes demonstrating the complexity of policing requirements and, moreover, highlighting the demand for skill sets not generally attracted to police work. Placentia Police Chief Ward Smith reported his department's policy had been adopted in the mid-1970s as part of a focus on juvenile delinquency and that his department's first civilian detective had come from a child protective services agency. Similarly, Commander Eric Akerlind of the Orange County District Attorney's Office reported his department had developed the position due to its difficulty finding or developing sworn investigators with expertise in economic crimes. He stated his department had specifically developed job specifications and a compensation package that would attract professionals from the banking industry, the California Bureau of Real

Estate, the California Franchise Tax Board, and various federal agencies. Peoria Police Lieutenant Anthony Wolfe noted his department had adopted the policy as a means of improving service by attracting applicants with skills not commonly possessed by those in the sworn candidate pool.

Table 4. Reason for Policy Adoption

Did your department adopt a policy of using civilian detectives for the purpose of reducing costs?			
Costa Mesa PD	Yes		
Huntington Beach PD			Cause unknown
Mesa PD			Cause unknown
Orange County DA Inv.		No	Adopted to broaden applicant pool
Peoria PD		No	Adopted to broaden applicant pool
Placentia PD		No	Adopted to broaden applicant pool
San Bernardino PD	Yes		
Santa Ana PD		No	Adopted to promote community policing
Sarasota PD			Cause unknown

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

While reducing costs was not the reason for adoption by all departments, 100 percent of those analyzed were found to have realized savings whether the benefit was intended or not.⁶⁴ The average savings among departments was 29 percent when comparing top step salaries of civilian detectives against those of sworn detectives (see

⁶⁴ “Salary Resolutions and City Contracts with Employee Associations,” Costa Mesa California, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://www.costamesaca.gov/index.aspx?page=1192>; “Employee Salaries and Benefits,” City of Huntington Beach, California, accessed August 30, 2015, http://huntingtonbeachca.gov/government/departments/human_resources/compensation-data/; “Pay Plans,” Mesa AZ, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://apps.mesaaz.gov/jobdescriptions/PayPlans>; “Title Schematic,” Orange County, California, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://ocgov.com/gov/hr/classification/titleschem>; “Job Descriptions (Alphabetical),” Peoria Arizona, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://www.peoriaaz.gov/NewSecondary.aspx?id=54143>; “Employee Compensation,” Placentia California, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://www.placentia.org/index.aspx?NID=596>; “Human Resources,” City of San Bernardino, accessed August 31, 2015, <http://www.ci.san-bernardino.ca.us/cityhall/hr/default.asp>; “Personnel Services,” City of Santa Ana, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://www.ci.santa-ana.ca.us/personnel/>; “Job Descriptions,” City of Sarasota, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/sarasotagov/default.cfm?SearchLetter=P&action=agencyspecs&AgencyID=1412>.

Table 5).⁶⁵ The department with the highest savings per employee was San Bernardino, at 57 percent, and the lowest was Placentia, at 16 percent.⁶⁶ The figures used for salary comparison were those most recently posted on the human resource websites of sample departments. This finding validates one of the central hypotheses of this thesis: that implementation of this policy enables departments to reduce costs.

Table 5. Top Step Monthly Salaries

	Sworn Detective	Civilian Detective	Savings
Costa Mesa PD	\$9008.00	\$6001.00	33%
Huntington Beach PD	\$7274.83	\$5052.66	31%
Mesa PD	\$6375.20	\$5245.06	18%
Orange County DA Inv.	\$9401.60	\$6295.46	33%
Peoria PD	\$6123.86	\$4827.33	21%
Placentia PD	\$6545.08	\$5505.08	16%
San Bernardino PD	\$8898.54	\$3869.00	57%
Santa Ana PD	\$7355.00	\$5790.00	21%
Sarasota PD	\$5489.46	\$3898.26	29%

Adapted from “Salary Resolutions,” Costa Mesa California; “Employee Salary Benefits,” City of Huntington Beach, California; “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ; “Title Schematic,” Orange County, California; “Job Descriptions (Alphabetical),” Peoria Arizona; “Employee Compensation,” Placentia California; “Human Resources,” City of San Bernardino; “Personnel Services,” City of Santa Ana; “Job Descriptions,” The City of Sarasota.

2. Employee Training/Readiness Time

For purposes of this research, employee training/readiness time was determined as the number of weeks between an employee’s date of hire and the day they are deemed

⁶⁵ “Salary Resolutions,” Costa Mesa California; “Employee Salaries and Benefits,” City of Huntington Beach California; “Pay Plans,” Mesa AZ; “Title Schematic,” Orange County, California; “Job Descriptions (Alphabetical),” Peoria Arizona; “Employee Compensation,” City of Placentia, accessed August 30, 2015, <http://placentia.org/index.aspx?NID=596>; “Human Resources,” City of San Bernardino; “Class Specifications,” City of Santa Anna, accessed April 20, 2015, <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/santaana/default.cfm?action=viewclassspec&classSpecID=794738&viewOnly=yes>; “Job Descriptions,” City of Sarasota.

⁶⁶ “Human Resources,” City of San Bernardino; “Employee Compensation,” Placentia, California.

competent as an autonomous investigator. Among the research population, interviewees representing 88 percent reported experiencing longer readiness periods for sworn detectives, with academy and field training consuming an average of 44 weeks.⁶⁷ While the average period of academy or classroom training for civilians was reported to be slightly less than two weeks, on-the-job training figures proved more elusive. Figures were only available for 33 percent of the population and, of that 33 percent, the average was found to be approximately 10 weeks.⁶⁸ Fifty-five percent of the population was found to structure on-the-job training solely around employee needs.⁶⁹ Of the municipal departments, 87 percent were found to require sworn personnel to serve as autonomous patrolmen before transferring or promoting into the role of detective. Interviewees from municipal departments also reported that officers typically spend two or more years in patrol before making the transition. The data in Tables 6 and 7 summarize these findings. For purposes of this research, time spent as a patrolman was excluded from calculations of formal and informal training.

⁶⁷ Rob Sharpnack (Chief of Costa Mesa PD), in discussion with author, July 29, 2015; John Cottriel (Lieutenant of Huntington Beach PD), in discussion with author, July 20, 2015; Stephanie Derivan (Lieutenant of Mesa PD), in discussion with author, July 25, 2015; Eric Akerlind (Commander of Orange County DA Inv.), in discussion with author, August 3, 2015; Anthony Wolfe (Lieutenant of Peoria PD), in discussion with author, July 28, 2015; Ward Smith (Chief of Placentia PD), in discussion with author, July 27, 2015; Jarrod Burguan (Chief of San Bernardino PD), in discussion with author, August 9, 2015; Carlos Rojas (Chief of Santa Ana PD), in discussion with author, July 20, 2015.

⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁶⁹ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Jodie Martinez (Sergeant of Mesa PD), in discussion with author, July 30, 2015; Smith, Placentia.

Table 6. Sworn Detective Training/Readiness Time

Weeks of Training	Academy/Classroom	On the Job
Costa Mesa PD	26	16
Huntington Beach PD	26	16–20
Mesa PD	20	16–18
Orange County DA Inv.	26	4
Peoria PD	20	12–16
Placentia PD	26	16–17
San Bernardino PD	26	16
Santa Ana PD	26	52
Sarasota PD	Unknown	Unknown

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

Table 7. Civilian Detective Training/Readiness Time

Weeks of Training	Academy/Classroom	On the Job
Costa Mesa PD	3	As needed
Huntington Beach PD	1	As needed
Mesa PD	0–10	As needed
Orange County DA Inv.	0	8–12
Peoria PD	0	16
Placentia PD	2–4	As needed
San Bernardino PD	1	4–6
Santa Ana PD	0	As needed
Sarasota PD	Unknown	Unknown

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

3. Work Output

One of the goals of this research was to determine if the work output of civilian detectives is equal in quality and volume to that of sworn detectives. In order to ensure the comparison was relative, interviewees were asked to limit consideration to only those duties described in their civilian job descriptions. Using these criteria, 55 percent reported their civilian detectives to be equivalent to sworn detectives (see Table 8).⁷⁰ Peoria and Placentia categorized civilian work output as equivalent or greater and Costa Mesa categorized it as greater.⁷¹ Conversely, no departments reported lesser work output by civilians, and all interviewees noted that, without civilian detectives, the duties in their job descriptions would either be performed by sworn detectives or neglected entirely.⁷² While reducing costs is an important consideration for any city manager or police chief, doing so at the expense of operational effectiveness is not a sound practice. Therefore, assessing the quality and volume of work produced by civilians was a key factor in analyzing this policy. Data drawn from this aspect of the research is significant in that it demonstrates the benefits of lower costs do not have to come at the expense of inferior work product. This validates two primary factors needed to make an argument that the policy is efficacious.

⁷⁰ Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Akerlind, Orange County; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Rojas, Santa Ana.

⁷¹ Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Sharpnack, Costa Mesa.

⁷² Ibid.; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Rojas, Santa Ana; Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Rojas, Santa Ana.

Table 8. Work Output

Within the scope of their duties, have civilian detectives produced a lesser, equivalent, or greater work output/case clearance rate than sworn detectives?	
Costa Mesa PD	Greater
Huntington Beach PD	Equivalent
Mesa PD	Equivalent
Orange County DA Inv.	Equivalent
Peoria PD	Equivalent to/greater
Placentia PD	Equivalent to/greater
San Bernardino PD	Equivalent
Santa Ana PD	Equivalent
Sarasota PD	Unknown

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

B. QUALITATIVE

1. Employment Qualifications

In order to analyze employment qualifications for civilian detectives, data was extrapolated from each department's job description and coded under the sub-categories of education, experience, knowledge, and additional desired qualifications. In analyzing the educational requirements, little consistency was found among departments. At the low end of the spectrum, 22 percent specified no educational requirements, while another 22 percent were found to require only a high school diploma or GED equivalent.⁷³ At the middle of the spectrum, 22 percent were found to require high school diplomas supplemented by some college-level coursework.⁷⁴ Among the departments requiring

⁷³ "Job Classifications," Orange County Government, accessed September 6, 2015, <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/oc/default.cfm?action=viewclassspec&classSpecID=39668&agency=761&viewOnly=yes>; "Class Specifications," City of Santa Anna; "Job Descriptions," Mesa AZ, accessed September 6, 2015, <http://apps.mesaaz.gov/jobdescriptions/jobdescriptions>; "Job Descriptions (Alphabetical)," Peoria Arizona.

⁷⁴ "Civilian Investigator: Salary Range," Government Jobs, accessed April 22, 2015, <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/costamesa/default.cfm?action=specbulletin&ClassSpecID=77203&headerfooter=0>; "Jobs Available," City of Huntington Beach California, accessed September 6, 2015, <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/huntingtonbeach/default.cfm?action=viewclassspec&classSpecID=952148&agency=1374&viewOnly=yes>.

college education, 22 percent were found to require an associate's degree and 11 percent a bachelor's degree.⁷⁵ See Table 9 for a summary of required educational qualifications. One of the common themes noted on educational requirements was that many departments allowed candidates to offset education with additional years of experience or vice versa.

Table 9. Minimum Educational Qualifications

Costa Mesa PD	High school supplemented by college coursework
Huntington Beach PD	High school supplemented by college coursework
Mesa PD	High school or GED
Orange County DA Inv.	None specified
Peoria PD	High school or GED
Placentia PD	Bachelor's degree in criminal justice or related field
San Bernardino PD	Associate's degree or high school diploma with prior experience
Santa Ana PD	None specified
Sarasota PD	Associates degree

Adapted from "Civilian Investigator: Salary Range," Costa Mesa California; "Jobs Available" City of Huntington Beach California; "Job Descriptions," Mesa AZ; "Job Classifications" Orange County Government; "Job Descriptions (Alphabetical)," Peoria Arizona; "Employment Opportunities," City of Placentia; "Criminal Investigation Officer: Salary Range," City of San Bernardino; "Personnel Services," City of Santa Ana; "Civilian Police Investigator: Salary Range," City of Sarasota.

Among the population, departments were found to require an average of 2.8 years of prior experience in law enforcement or a related field (see Table 10). At the low end of the spectrum, 22 percent were found to require as little as one year; at the high end, 22

⁷⁵ "Criminal Investigation Officer: Salary Range," City of San Bernardino, accessed April 20, 2015, <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/citysanbernardino/default.cfm?action=specbulletin&ClassSpecID=1014757&headerfooter=0>; "Civilian Police Investigator: Salary Range," City of Sarasota, accessed April 20, 2015, <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/sarasotagov/default.cfm?action=specbulletin&ClassSpecID=844735&headerfooter=0>; "Employment Opportunities," City of Placentia, accessed September 6, 2015, <http://placentia.org/Jobs.aspx?UniqueId=82&From=All&CommunityJobs=False&JobID=Police-Civilian-Investigator-60>.

percent were found to require at least five years of prior experience.⁷⁶ One of the common themes, noted among 33 percent of the population, was that they sought experience specific to banking, financial investigations, or claims management.⁷⁷ As noted in the sub-chapter on education, several departments were found to allow candidates to offset years of experience with higher education. An important finding on this topic was that, while sworn detectives take longer to train, they are not required to possess the same levels of pre-employment experience as civilians.

Table 10. Minimum Experience

Costa Mesa PD	2 years investigative/analytical, preferably in law enforcement
Huntington Beach PD	3 years law enforcement, code enforcement, or police support
Mesa PD	3–5 years public contact with 2 years LE or financial investigation
Orange County DA Inv.	5 years investigative with 2 years specific to financial
Peoria PD	2–4 years criminal investigative experience
Placentia PD	3 years investigation of civilian crimes or similar cases
San Bernardino PD	3 years LE/claims investigation or an associate’s degree
Santa Ana PD	1 year LE experience involving investigation and report writing
Sarasota PD	1–2 years LE experience

Adapted from “Civilian Investigator: Salary Range,” Costa Mesa California; “Jobs Available,” City of Huntington Beach California; “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ; “Job Classifications,” Orange County Government; “Job Descriptions (Alphabetical),” Peoria Arizona; “Employment Opportunities,” City of Placentia; “Criminal Investigation Officer: Salary Range,” City of San Bernardino; “Personnel Services,” City of Santa Ana; “Civilian Police Investigator: Salary Range,” City of Sarasota.

Among the sample population, all departments were found to have minimum knowledge requirements for civilian detectives and all were found to be relatively consistent (see Table 11). Required knowledge domains generally consisted of basic

⁷⁶ “Class Specifications,” City of Santa Ana; “Civilian Police Investigator: Salary Range,” City of Sarasota; “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ; “Job Classifications,” Orange Country Government.

⁷⁷ “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ; “Job Classifications,” Orange County Government; “Criminal Investigation Officer: Salary Range,” City of San Bernardino.

laws, police procedures, investigative procedures, interviews and interrogations, analytic skills, customer service skills, case management skills, writing skills, and basic use of common software programs. Much like the findings on experiential requirements, some departments placed emphasis on knowledge of financial investigations and practices.⁷⁸

Table 11. Minimum Required Knowledge

Costa Mesa PD	Law, financial, investigations, interviews, computers technology
Huntington Beach PD	Police procedures, law, investigations, customer service
Mesa PD	Police procedures, English/writing, financial procedures
Orange County DA Inv.	None specified
Peoria PD	Police procedures and criminal investigation
Placentia PD	Law, police procedures, interviews, analysis, writing, case mgt.
San Bernardino PD	Law, police procedures, investigations, customer service, writing
Santa Ana PD	Law and police procedures
Sarasota PD	Customer service, confidentiality, interpersonal skills, Microsoft Office

Adapted from “Civilian Investigator: Salary Range,” Costa Mesa California; “Jobs Available,” City of Huntington Beach California; “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ; “Job Classifications,” Orange County Government; “Job Descriptions (Alphabetical),” Peoria Arizona; “Employment Opportunities,” City of Placentia; “Criminal Investigation Officer: Salary Range,” City of San Bernardino; “Personnel Services,” City of Santa Ana; “Civilian Police Investigator: Salary Range,” City of Sarasota.

⁷⁸ “Civilian Investigator: Salary Range,” Government Jobs; “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ.

The majority of departments were found to format their job descriptions in a way that listed necessary qualifications as “minimum” requirements (see Table 12). However, Mesa and Santa Ana were found to have an additional section titled “desirable” qualifications.⁷⁹ Unlike the majority, these two departments used this section to address education and experience. Santa Ana listed college-level coursework in police science and Mesa listed experience with financial investigations.⁸⁰

Table 12. Desirable Qualifications

Costa Mesa PD	None specified
Huntington Beach PD	None specified
Mesa PD	Experience in financial investigations or with financial records
Orange County DA Inv.	None specified
Peoria PD	None specified
Placentia PD	None specified
San Bernardino PD	None specified
Santa Ana PD	College-level coursework in police science or a related field
Sarasota PD	None specified

Adapted from “Civilian Investigator: Salary Range,” Costa Mesa California; “Jobs Available,” City of Huntington Beach California; “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ; “Job Classifications,” Orange County Government; “Job Descriptions (Alphabetical),” Peoria Arizona; “Employment Opportunities,” City of Placentia; “Criminal Investigation Officer: Salary Range,” City of San Bernardino; “Personnel Services,” City of Santa Ana; “Civilian Police Investigator: Salary Range,” City of Sarasota.

2. Training Standards

As noted previously in the chapter, training can take up an inordinate amount of time before an employee is available to perform the job functions for which he or she was hired. Among the sample population, 55 percent of departments were found to require formal academy or classroom-type training as part of their basic civilian training

⁷⁹ “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ; “Class Specifications,” City of Santa Ana.

⁸⁰ “Class Specifications,” City of Santa Ana; “Job Descriptions,” Mesa AZ.

protocols.⁸¹ Although these departments used various academies and training institutes, coursework was generally consistent by encompassing basic legal principles and criminal investigative practices.⁸² Among departments that required formal training, San Bernardino's standards were the lowest, with a three-day basic criminal investigation course, and Placentia's were the highest, with two to three weeks of basic criminal investigation plus a week of interview and interrogation training.⁸³ Thirty-three percent of departments were found to require no basic formal training and Sarasota, which accounted for 11 percent of the population, could not be determined.⁸⁴ Relative to on-the-job training, sample departments were found to be largely informal, with 55 percent having no established timeframe or structure and 33 percent having timeframes ranging from four to sixteen weeks, but also lacking formal structure.⁸⁵ The departments that required formal basic training were found to also provide additional specialty training related to the assignments of their civilian detectives.⁸⁶ The data in Tables 13 and 14 summarize these findings.

⁸¹ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015.

⁸² Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015.

⁸³ Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Smith, Placentia.

⁸⁴ Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Rojas, Santa Ana.

⁸⁵ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Smith, Placentia; Rojas, Santa Ana; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015.

⁸⁶ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015.

Table 13. Minimum Required Training

Weeks of Training	Academy/Classroom	On the Job
Costa Mesa PD	PC 832	As needed
Huntington Beach PD	LAPD Detective School	As needed
Mesa PD	Various Academy courses	As needed
Orange County DA Inv.	None	8–12 weeks as needed
Peoria PD	None	16 weeks with trainer
Placentia PD	Presley Institute 80 hr ICI or PC 832 + Interview & Interrogation	As needed
San Bernardino PD	Basic criminal investigation	4–6 weeks
Santa Ana PD	None	As needed
Sarasota PD	Unknown	Unknown

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

Table 14. Additional Available Training

Costa Mesa PD	Any specialty training needed for assignments
Huntington Beach PD	Interview & Interrogation, Report Writing, any extra needed
Mesa PD	Any specialty training needed for assignments
Orange County DA Inv.	None
Peoria PD	None
Placentia PD	Any specialty training needed for assignments
San Bernardino PD	Any specialty training needed for assignments
Santa Ana PD	None
Sarasota PD	Unknown

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

3. Investigative Capabilities

A primary goal of this research was to determine if civilian detectives serve to enhance police departments' investigative capabilities. While initially probing this topic, interviewees representing 66 percent of the population reported their capabilities to have increased under the policy.⁸⁷ During his August 9 interview, San Bernardino Police Chief Jarrod Burguan stated his department's capabilities had potentially increased, but the program was too new to definitively make that determination. Additionally, Mesa Police Sergeant Jodie Martinez reported no difference in her department's capabilities and Sarasota's experience could not be determined. While Chief Burguan reported no definitive increase during his August 9 interview, he offered new insight during a December 16 interview, in which he stated capabilities had increased. This latter information boosted the percentage of those reporting increased capabilities to 77 percent (see Table 15).

Among interviewees who reported increased investigative efficiencies, several provided specific examples of how they had manifested. Huntington Beach Lieutenant John Cortriel described seeing improved capabilities due to the fact his department could afford greater numbers of personnel through this policy. Orange County Commander Eric Akerlind and Peoria Lieutenant Anthony Wolfe both reported their departments' capabilities had not only increased due to greater numbers of more affordable personnel, but also due to the unique skills and expertise of candidates recruited from the civilian candidate pool. Placentia Police Chief Ward Smith stated the policy had benefited his department by facilitating more efficient work distribution. Santa Ana Police Chief Carlos Rojas reported enhanced capabilities from civilian detectives working cases that ordinarily would not be assigned. While each interviewee described his or her benefit in slightly different terms, a theme emerged: each example entailed the capacity to accomplish more work without having to spend more money.

On December 16, 2015, San Bernardino Police Chief Jarrod Burguan was interviewed a second time in order to focus on how civilian detectives had impacted the

⁸⁷ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cortriel, Huntington Beach; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Rojas, Santa Ana.

investigative capabilities of his department during its response to the December 2 terrorist attack at the IRC. During this interview, he described that civilian detectives had definitively bolstered capabilities, providing two specific examples. In the first, he described that an asset forfeiture analyst had been responsible for developing the first promising lead linking suspect Sayed Farook to the vehicle used by the attackers. As a result, his department was able to narrow its search efforts early on and locate Farook and his accomplice, Malik, within a matter of hours. He described that, although this particular employee bears the title “analyst,” she is essentially a civilian detective with advanced knowledge on the legal proceedings for asset seizures. Chief Burguan credited her with not only achieving a significant breakthrough in the case, but potentially saving lives by doing so. In the second example, he described that, subsequent to the attack, civilian detectives assumed responsibility for processing all routine criminal cases while sworn detectives were re-deployed to the field. This enabled his department to meet its obligation to routine criminal matters by ensuring arrested suspects were charged and prevented from early release back into the community.

Table 15. Impact on Investigative Capabilities

Has your department’s investigative capabilities increased, remained the same, or decreased as a result of using civilian detectives?		
Costa Mesa PD	Increased	
Huntington Beach PD	Increased	
Mesa PD		Remained the same
Orange County DA Inv.	Increased	
Peoria PD	Increased	
Placentia PD	Increased	
San Bernardino PD	Increased	
Santa Ana PD	Increased	
Sarasota PD	Unknown	

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

4. Emergency Response Capabilities

Another primary goal of this research was to determine if civilian detectives can bolster police departments' emergency response capabilities. Responses were mixed, with 44 percent of the population reporting increased capabilities and 33 percent reporting no change (see Table 16).⁸⁸ The remaining 22 percent consisted of the Orange County District Attorney's Office, which does not perform emergency response, and Sarasota, for which data was not available.⁸⁹ Among departments that reported increased capabilities, the reasons were largely consistent with those attributed increased investigative capabilities.

Huntington Beach Lieutenant John Cottriel stated his department's emergency response capabilities had increased as a result of retaining more personnel at lesser cost. Placentia Police Chief Ward Smith stated his civilian detective bolsters his department's emergency response capabilities because she can assist patrol personnel with investigations, allowing them to work more expeditiously and return to service. During his August 9 interview, San Bernardino Police Chief Jarrod Burguan stated his department's emergency response personnel have been significantly under resourced due to the city's financial problems, but noted the situation would be far worse if not for his ability to use civilians in his detective bureau and reassign sworn detectives to the street.

Peoria Lieutenant Anthony Wolfe cited better skill sets possessed by civilians as a reason for increased capabilities in his department. He described that, earlier in the year, his city had responded to an influx of Super Bowl XLIX patrons from the neighboring City of Glendale. To address this event's added homeland security challenges, his department had reassigned sworn detectives to the field in order to surge its presence. He stated his department was only able to do so by operating its detective bureau using civilians. While addressing this topic in his December 16 interview, San Bernardino Police Chief Jarrod Burguan reiterated that, subsequent to the December 2 terrorist

⁸⁸ Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Martinez, Mesa; Rojas, Santa Ana.

⁸⁹ Akerlind, Orange County.

attack, civilian detectives had assumed responsibility for processing all routine criminal cases while sworn detectives were re-deployed to the field. This not only enabled the department to ensure all routine criminal cases were adequately processed, but, more significantly, it enabled all sworn detectives to focus on a counterterrorism response.

Table 16. Impact on Emergency Response Capabilities

Has your department's emergency response capabilities increased, remained the same, or decreased as a result of using civilian detectives?		
Costa Mesa PD		Remained the same
Huntington Beach PD	Increased	
Mesa PD		Remained the same
Orange County DA Inv.		Not applicable
Peoria PD	Increased	
Placentia PD	Increased	
San Bernardino PD	Increased	
Santa Ana PD		Remained the same
Sarasota PD	Unknown	

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

Of all that was learned during the course of research, Lieutenant Wolfe's Super Bowl example and Chief Burguan's terror attack example spoke to the very heart of this thesis. In determining if civilian detectives can enhance cities' policing and homeland security, these examples not only provided an affirmative answer, but also demonstrated exactly how it can be achieved. They described the synergy possible when one component of a policing organization is bolstered by another through implementation of smarter and more efficient policy.

5. Limitations/Restrictions

Relative to the limitations and restrictions placed on civilian detectives, results were largely consistent; 88 percent reported their personnel cannot perform arrests or

serve warrants.⁹⁰ Civilian detectives do not have the sworn status that allows them to carry a gun and lawfully impose on 4th Amendment rights.⁹¹ Additionally, the same 88 percent of departments required their civilian detectives to be accompanied by sworn partners when contacting victims, witnesses, or suspects in the field.⁹²

In researching if prosecutors impede the use of civilian detectives, 77 percent of departments reported having no prosecutorial limitations or restrictions placed on their personnel.⁹³ One exception was found in San Bernardino, where Police Chief Jarrod Burguan reported his county's district attorney will not prosecute murder or child abuse cases investigated by his department's civilians. Additionally, he described that his civilian detectives cannot author search warrants. While the level of autonomy granted to civilian detectives varied by department, Santa Ana described the greatest self-imposed limitation in that, once civilian detectives identify a suspect, the case is reassigned to a sworn detective. Duties that do not require arrest powers or entail physical danger were generally permissible by all departments with the exception of Sarasota, in which limitations and restrictions could not be determined.⁹⁴

6. Labor Relations

Because labor unions can influence policy decisions, this research sought to determine how those representing sworn detectives had responded to civilian detective policies within the sample population. Among the population, 44 percent reported support, 33 percent reported neutrality, 11 percent reported opposition, and Sarasota could not be determined (see Table 17).⁹⁵ Among those to report neutrality, some were

⁹⁰ Wolfe, Peoria.

⁹¹ Ibid.

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Rojas, Santa Ana.

⁹⁴ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Rojas, Santa Ana.

⁹⁵ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Rojas, Santa Ana.

cautious to note that a lack of opposition did not equate a statement of support.⁹⁶ Additionally, most interviewees who noted support either qualified the assessment or provided some explanation of cause. As an example, Orange County Commander Eric Akerlind stated his department's sworn investigator's union was supportive as long as civilians were only used to investigate financial crimes. Placentia Police Chief Ward Smith stated his department's sworn detective's union was supportive because their department's single civilian detective had been highly successful in the role. Lastly, Santa Ana Police Chief Carlos Rojas stated his department's sworn detective's union was supportive because the civilian detectives were among its membership.

Table 17. Sworn Labor Position toward Civilian Detectives

Has your department's sworn detective labor group supported, remained neutral, or opposed the use of civilian detectives?			
Costa Mesa PD	Opposed		
Huntington Beach PD		Neutral	
Mesa PD		Neutral	
Orange County DA Inv.			Supported
Peoria PD			Supported
Placentia PD			Supported
San Bernardino PD		Neutral	
Santa Ana PD			Supported
Sarasota PD	Unknown		

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

⁹⁶ Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015.

7. Community Relations

Citizens are significant stakeholders in public safety matters. Consequently, this research sought to determine how those from cities in the sample population felt about civilian detective policies. Among the population, 33 percent reported support, 55 percent reported neutrality, and Sarasota could not be determined (see Table 18).⁹⁷ A common theme reported by interviewees was that citizens rarely knew the difference between civilian and sworn detectives.⁹⁸ In the Cities of Mesa and San Bernardino, interviewees noted citizens were simply happy to get service from any classification of personnel given that austere budgets and staffing shortages had resulted in reduced service levels.⁹⁹

Table 18. Community Position toward Civilian Detectives

Has your local community supported, remained neutral, or opposed the use of civilian detectives?			
Costa Mesa PD		Neutral	
Huntington Beach PD		Neutral	
Mesa PD		Neutral	
Orange County DA Inv.			Supported
Peoria PD		Neutral	
Placentia PD			Supported
San Bernardino PD			Supported
Santa Ana PD		Neutral	
Sarasota PD	Unknown		

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

⁹⁷ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Martinez, Mesa; Akerlind, Orange County; Wolfe, Peoria; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Rojas, Santa Ana.

⁹⁸ Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Akerlind, Orange County; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015.

⁹⁹ Martinez, Mesa; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015.

C. FUTURE TRENDS

This research sought to determine how departments in the sample population envisioned the future of their civilian detective programs. While probing this issue, interviewees representing 55 percent of the population reported either recent expansion or plans for future expansion (see Table 19).¹⁰⁰ Another 33 percent reported plans to maintain current personnel numbers, and Sarasota could not be determined.¹⁰¹ Huntington Beach Lieutenant John Cottriel stated that, at the time of inception, his department had titled its personnel as civilian check investigators and limited their scope of duties to investigation of bad checks. However, his department had recently retitled these personnel as community services officers for the purpose of expanding their scope of duties to investigate crimes against persons, property crimes, and vice crimes.¹⁰²

Orange County Commander Eric Akerlind reported his department had recently eliminated one sworn position in order to fund two civilians, thereby achieving double the work output. Placentia Police Chief Ward Smith reported plans to seek funding for an additional civilian detective to staff his department's professional standards division. San Bernardino Police Chief Jarrod Burguan reported plans to expand his civilian detective ranks in order to bolster the department's emergency response capabilities. He stated the shorter readiness time for civilians was helping his department rebuild its patrol force, which is significantly depleted. Santa Ana Police Chief Carlos Rojas stated he would like to expand his program and believed it could be better utilized if redefined to meet the department's current needs.

¹⁰⁰ Cottriel, Huntington Beach; Akerlind, Orange County; Smith, Placentia; Burguan, San Bernardino, August 9, 2015; Rojas, Santa Ana.

¹⁰¹ Sharpnack, Costa Mesa; Martinez, Mesa; Wolfe, Peoria.

¹⁰² Cottriel, Huntington Beach

Table 19. Future of Civilian Detective Policy

Is your department planning to reduce, maintain, or expand its use of civilian detectives?			
Costa Mesa PD		Maintain	
Huntington Beach PD			Recently expanded
Mesa PD		Maintain	
Orange County DA Inv.			Recently expanded
Peoria PD		Maintain	
Placentia PD			Expand
San Bernardino PD			Expand
Santa Ana PD			Expand
Sarasota PD	Unknown		

Note: Data derived from interview responses.

V. FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. FINDINGS

The primary goal of this research was to determine if using civilians to perform the duties of sworn detectives can enhance cities' contributions to policing and homeland security. Through examination of nine U.S. law enforcement departments in its small (n=9) data set, this research concluded cities can achieve significant cost savings while maintaining or enhancing various investigative and emergency response capabilities. In this regard, the BCA substantiated the policy as efficacious. This research also found that candidate pools for sworn positions are not producing the caliber of personnel desired by many departments. Therefore, adoption of this policy has afforded some departments the ability to recruit from other pools bearing individuals with skill sets more useful to law enforcement and homeland security. These findings suggest other cities could benefit from the policy and justify considering how it can be refined.

While the benefits of this policy appear promising, this research also discovered the absence of a uniform national framework to guide cities in its adoption and implementation. This void has resulted in inconsistent training standards and uncertainty on the part of police chiefs tasked with defining scope of duties for their civilian detectives. It has also resulted in civilian detectives lacking the professional recognition and legitimacy possessed by sworn detectives and other civilian personnel whose knowledge domains and scope of duties are clearly defined and often certified. Until a uniform national framework is adopted and published, cities employing this unorthodox approach will continue to operate in a gray area, exposing their civilian detective policies to misunderstanding and underutilization. Furthermore, cities that have not adopted this policy will be less apt to do so while the concept is still mired in ambiguity.

B. RECOMMENDATIONS

- (1) Further research should be conducted to more accurately quantify the rate at which arrests and physically dangerous duties are core components of detective assignments.**

While this research determined civilian detectives can produce similar work output at lesser costs, it also determined they cannot perform arrests or other duties deemed physically dangerous. Existing literature suggests these duties constitute a small extent of actual detective work, but exact data is largely nonexistent. This means that BCAs are based on estimates and not grounded in statistically relevant or defensible data, creating a more difficult business case for cities considering the policy. Although jurisdiction-specific audits will always provide the most accurate information, the publication of data reflecting national averages would provide a basis for justifying these audits in the first place. City managers and police chiefs often face resistance to change, especially if that change disrupts current industry practices or homeostasis; in the face of speculation, data can be a powerful advocacy tool.

- (2) The United States Department of Justice should sponsor and fund development of a uniform national framework for adoption of civilian detective policies. The framework should be developed by a public policy institute with credibility on public safety matters.**

Departments with civilian detective policies administer their policies inconsistently. Most interviewees lacked certainty as to what the exact role of civilian detectives should be. This is likely because criminal investigation by civilians has not received formal recognition as a profession within the law enforcement industry. The absence of this recognition—along with the absence of a uniform national framework articulating their role—has created an environment in which adopting agencies are left to chart their own paths. The city managers and police chiefs who have chosen to do so face a variety of legal, technical, and organizational/cultural hazards. They must identify and balance the often competing expectations of internal staff, labor groups, prosecutors, and citizens while knowing that any miscalculation can potentially derail their efforts. Publication of a uniform national framework for policy adoption by a credible authority

would provide city managers and police chiefs a stronger platform for advocacy by diminishing the policy's ambiguities.

(3) State peace officer standards and training (POST) commissions should establish standardized training and certification guidelines.

Currently, there are no uniform guidelines or professional certifications in place for civilian detectives. While some departments have independently adopted in-house guidelines, research found others had simply hired civilian detectives and put them to work without formalizing training. When asked about benchmarks for field training, one of the more common descriptors among interviewees was “as needed.” It should not be forgotten that civilian detectives bear an equally significant responsibility to their sworn counterparts; their analysis and conclusions result in justice for victims, accountability for suspects, and ultimately impact the credibility of their employing organizations. It therefore seems logical that treating their indoctrination and development with casual regard will expose cities to public criticism, liability, and loss of confidence in the policy itself. Industry doctrine traditionally emphasizes rigid standards for knowledge domains, formal didactics, and structured field training. State POST commissions traditionally develop these standards based on their state's needs. While a uniform framework to guide policy adoption should be established at the national level, training and certification guidelines should be developed at the state level just as they are for sworn personnel. Because these guidelines differ from state to state for sworn personnel, this thesis does not attempt to specifically identify what they should be for civilians.

C. CONCLUSION

There are risks and costs to a program of action. But they are far less than the long-range risks and costs of comfortable inaction.

—John F. Kennedy

In today's environment, homeland security threats have grown to include cities' inability to fund basic police functions and recruit skilled personnel. The adoption of civilian detective policies to address these threats is not only innovative, but represents a profound ideological shift in how cities protect the public. Among adopting cities, an average of 10.5 percent of detective personnel are now civilianized. When considering that approximately 15 percent of the nation's 765,000 sworn law enforcement personnel are detectives, a salary savings of 29 percent per civilian employee could reshape one of the largest and most expensive components of the homeland security enterprise.¹⁰³ However, adoption of this policy does not come without risk. Establishing proper civilian/sworn ratios requires cities to quantify and partition the very real dangers of detective work from the routine and non-hazardous. And while the budgetary impacts discovered by this research offer a compelling business case for policy adoption, civilianization of detective work is highly disruptive to an industry long steeped in tradition. Therefore, in considering adoption, cities should carefully analyze the benefits and constraints while recognizing that comfortable inaction may bear equally significant risks.

¹⁰³ Chaiken, Greenwood, and Petersilia, "The Criminal Investigation Process," 59; Rayner, "Re-Evaluating the Criminal Investigative Process," 28; Reaves, "Census of State And Local Law Enforcement Agencies, 2008," 1.

LIST OF REFERENCES

- The 9/11 Commission Report: Final Report of the National Commission on Terrorist Attacks Upon the United States*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2011.
- Alderden, Megan, and Wesley G. Skogan. "The Place of Civilians in Policing." *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management* 37, no. 2 (2014): 259–84. doi: 10.1108/PIJPSM-12-2012-0073.
- Bergen, Peter. "The Biggest U.S. Terror Attack Since 9/11 | RealClear Politics." December 5, 2015. http://www.realclearpolitics.com/2015/12/05/the_biggest_us_terror_attack_since_911_371360.html.
- Botelho, Greg and Ralph Ellis. "San Bernardino Attack Investigated as Act of Terrorism." *CNN*. December 5, 2015. <http://www.cnn.com/2015/12/04/us/san-bernardino-shooting/index.html>.
- Chaiken, Jan M., Peter W. Greenwood, and Joan R. Petersilia. *The Criminal Investigation Process* (P-5628-1). Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 1976. <http://www.rand.org/pubs/papers/P5628-1.html>.
- City of Huntington Beach California. "Employee Salaries and Benefits." Accessed August 30, 2015. http://huntingtonbeachca.gov/government/departments/human_resources/compensation-data/.
- . "Jobs Available." Accessed September 6, 2015. <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/huntingtonbeach/default.cfm?action=viewclassspec&classSpecID=952148&agency=1374&viewOnly=yes>.
- City of Placentia. "Employee Compensation." Accessed August 30, 2015, <http://placentia.org/index.aspx?NID=596>.
- . "Employment Opportunities." Accessed September 6, 2015, <http://placentia.org/Jobs.aspx?UniqueId=82&From=All&CommunityJobs=False&JobID=Police-Civilian-Investigator-60>.
- City of San Bernardino. "Criminal Investigation Officer: Salary Range." Accessed April 20, 2015. <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/citysanbernardino/default.cfm?action=specbulletin&ClassSpecID=1014757&headerfooter=0>.
- . "Human Resources." Accessed August 31, 2015. <http://www.ci.san-bernardino.ca.us/cityhall/hr/default.asp>.

- City of Santa Anna. "Class Specifications." Accessed April 20, 2015. <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/santaana/default.cfm?action=viewclassspec&classSpecID=794738&viewOnly=yes>.
- . "Personnel Services." Accessed August 30, 2015. <http://www.ci.santa-ana.ca.us/personnel/>.
- City of Sarasota. "Civilian Police Investigator: Salary Range." Accessed April 20, 2015. <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/sarasotagov/default.cfm?action=specbulletin&ClassSpecID=844735&headerfooter=0>.
- . "Job Descriptions." Accessed August 30, 2015. <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/sarasotagov/default.cfm?SearchLetter=P&action=agencyspecs&AgencyID=1412>.
- Costa Mesa California. "Civilian Investigator: Salary Range." Accessed April 22, 2015. <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/costamesa/default.cfm?action=specbulletin&ClassSpecID=77203&headerfooter=0>.
- . "Salary Resolutions and City Contracts with Employee Associations." Accessed August 30, 2015, <http://www.costamesaca.gov/index.aspx?page=1192>.
- Davis, Robert C., Mary Lombardo, Daniel Woods, Christopher Koper, and Carl Hawkins. *Civilian Staff in Policing: An Assessment of the 2009 Byrne Civilian Hiring Program*. Washington, DC: National Institute of Justice, December 2013. <https://www.ncjrs.gov/app/publications/abstract.aspx?id=269042>.
- Department of Homeland Security. The 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review. Washington, DC: Department of Homeland Security, 2014. <http://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/publications/qhsr/2014-QHSR.pdf>.
- Gascon, George, Todd Foglesong, and National Institute of Justice, *Making Policing More Affordable: Managing Costs and Measuring Value in Policing*. Rochester, NY: Scholar's Choice, 2015.
- Government Accountability Office, *State and Local Governments' Fiscal Outlook: 2014 Update* (GAO-15-224SP). Washington, DC: Government Accountability Office, 2014). <http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-15-224SP>.
- Griffiths, Curt, and Nahanni Pollard. *Policing in Winnipeg: An Operational Review*. Ottawa, ON: Canadian Police Association, October 2013. <http://curtgriffiths.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/WPS-operational-review.pdf>.
- Horvath, Frank, Robert T Meesig, Yung Hyeock Lee. *National Survey of Police Policies and Practices Regarding the Criminal Investigations Process: Twenty-Five Years after RAND*. Lansing: University of Michigan, 2001.

- Ives, Martin, and Thad Calabrese. "Employee Benefit Financing and Municipal Bankruptcy." *The Journal of Government Financial Management* 62, no. 1 (Spring 2013): 12–18.
- Jeremy M. Wilson, Ph.D. "About." Accessed August 24, 2015. <http://www.jeremywilson.org/users/jeremy-wilson>.
- "Job Descriptions." Mesa AZ. zdaccessd September 6, 2015. <http://apps.mesaaz.gov/jobdescriptions/jobdescriptions/>.
- Katel, Peter. "Transnational Crime." *CQ Researcher by CQ Press*, 24, no. 30 (August 2014): 697–720.
- Kemp, Roger L. "Homeland Security: A Local Perspective." *Spectrum: Journal of State Government* 77, no. 2 (Spring 2004): 21–25.
- King, William and Jeremy Wilson. Integrating Civilian Staff into Police Agencies. Washington, DC: Community Oriented Policing Services, 2014.
- Leonard, Dutch, and Arnold M. Howitt. *Preliminary Thoughts and Observation on the Boston Marathon Bombings*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard, 2013. <http://www.hbs.edu/faculty/Pages/item.aspx?num=46718>.
- Liederbach, John, Eric J. Fritsch, and Charissa L. Womack. "Detective Workload and Opportunities for Increased Productivity in Criminal Investigations," *Police Practice & Research* 12, no. 1 (February 2011): 50–65. doi:10.1080/15614263.2010.497379.
- Matarese, Leonard. "Is the Current Model for Public Safety Service Delivery Sustainable?" *Public Management (00333611)* 95, no. 8 (September 2013): 9–13.
- Matarese, Leonard, Kenneth Chelst, Gayle Fisher-Stewart, and Albert Pearsall. "Public Safety Concept in the Post-9/11 World." *Public Management (00333611)* 89, no. 4 (May 2007): 14–17.
- Mesa AZ. "Pay Plans." Accessed August 30, 2015. <http://apps.mesaaz.gov/jobdescriptions/PayPlans>.
- Noble, Kenneth E., and Kevin M. Baum. "Municipal Bankruptcies: An Overview and Recent History of Chapter 9 of the Bankruptcy Code." *Pratt's Journal of Bankruptcy Law* 9, no. 6 (September 2013): 513–38.
- Office of the City Auditor. *Audit of Civilianization Opportunities in the San Jose Police Department*. San Jose, CA: City of San Jose, January 2010. <http://www.sanjoseca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/3227>.

- Office of the Inspector General: City of Chicago. *Review of Opportunities for Civilianization in the Chicago Police Department*. Chicago, IL: Office of the Inspector General, January 2013. <http://chicagoinspectorgeneral.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/01/IGO-Opportunities-for-Civilianization-within-CPD-Final-1-23-13.pdf>.
- Orange County, California. "Title Schematic." Accessed August 30, 2015, <http://ocgov.com/gov/hr/classification/titleschem>.
- Orange County Government. "Job Classifications." Accessed September 6, 2015. <http://agency.governmentjobs.com/oc/default.cfm?action=viewclassspec&classSpecID=39668&agency=761&viewOnly=yes>.
- Peoria Arizona. "Job Descriptions (Alphabetical)." Accessed August 30, 2015. <http://www.peoriaaz.gov/NewSecondary.aspx?id=54143>.
- Placentia California. "Employee Compensation." Accessed August 30, 2015. <http://www.placentia.org/index.aspx?NID=596>.
- Police Executive Research Forum. "About PERF." Accessed August 24, 2015. <http://www.policeforum.org/>.
- . *Organizational Assessment of the San Francisco Police Department: A Technical Report*. San Francisco, CA: Police Executive Research Forum, December 2008. <http://www.sf-police.org/Modules/ShowDocument.aspx?documentid=14694>.
- "Public Safety Devours City Budgets." *Orange County Register*. September 14, 2014. <http://www.ocregister.com/articles/public-635037-safety-percent.html>.
- Rayner, Jeremiah. "Re-Evaluating the Criminal Investigative Process: An Empirical Evaluation of Criminal Investigations in the United States." Ph.D. dissertation, University of Southern Mississippi, 2014. <http://aquila.usm.edu/dissertations/3>.
- Reaves, Brian. *Census of State and Local Law Enforcement Agencies, 2008*. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, July 2011. <http://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/csllea08.pdf>.
- . *Hiring and Retention of State and Local Law Enforcement Officers, 2008—Statistical Tables*. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, October 2012. <http://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/hrslleo08st.pdf>.
- . *Local Police Departments, 2013: Personnel, Policies, and Practices* (NCJ 248677). Washington, DC: Bureau of Justice Statistics, 2015). <http://www.bjs.gov/index.cfm?ty=pbdetail&iid=5279>.

- Rudolf, John. "Stockton's Poor Mired In Violence After Police Cuts, Recession." *Huffington Post*, March 19, 2012. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/03/18/stockton-poor-poverty-crime-california_n_1346096.html.
- "San Bernardino Blues: Bankrupt City Flailing amid Financial Overhaul," *Al Jazeera America*. August 31, 2014. <http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2014/8/31/bankrupt-downtownsanbernardino.html>.
- Schaible, Lonnie M., and James Sheffield. "Intelligence-Led Policing and Change in State Law Enforcement Agencies." *Policing* 35, no. 4 (2012): 761–84. doi: 10.1108/13639511211275643.
- The White House. *Management of Domestic Incidents* (HSPD-5). Washington, DC: The White House, 2003). <http://fas.org/irp/offdocs/nspd/hspd-5.html>.
- . *National Preparedness* (HSPD-8). Washington, DC: The White House, 2003). <http://fas.org/irp/offdocs/nspd/hspd-8.html>.
- Wilson, Jeremy M. "Articulating the Dynamic Police Staffing Challenge." *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management* 35, no. 2 (May 25, 2012): 327–55. doi:10.1108/13639511211230084.
- Wilson, Jeremy M., and Alexander Weiss. "Police Staffing Allocation and Managing Workload Demand: A Critical Assessment of Existing Practices." *Policing : A Journal of Policy and Practice* 8, no. 2 (June 2014). <http://search.proquest.com.libproxy.nps.edu/docview/1532703822/abstract/8748C9BF473E4D3FPQ/1?accountid=12702>.
- Wilson, Jeremy M, Alexander Weis, and Clifford Grammich. "Public Safety Consolidation: What Is It? How Does It Work?" *BOLO Be on the Lookout*, no. 2 (August 2012): 12.
- Wilson, Jeremy M, Bernard Rostker, and Cha-Chi Fan. *Recruiting and Retaining America's Finest*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2010. http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/monographs/2010/RAND_MG960.pdf.
- Wilson, Jeremy M., Erin Dalton, Charles Scheer, and Clifford A. Grammich. *Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2010. <http://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/MG959.html>.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST

1. Defense Technical Information Center
Ft. Belvoir, Virginia
2. Dudley Knox Library
Naval Postgraduate School
Monterey, California