

RPPR Final Report
as of 16-May-2020

Agency Code:

Proposal Number: 64585LSMRI

Agreement Number: W911NF-13-1-0342

INVESTIGATOR(S):

Name: Steven Hitlin
Email: steven-hitlin@uiowa.edu
Phone Number: 3193352499
Principal: Y

Organization: **University of Iowa @ Iowa City**

Address: 2 Gilmore Hall, Iowa City, IA 522421320

Country: USA

DUNS Number: 062761671

EIN: 426004813

Report Date: 11-Feb-2020

Date Received: 16-May-2020

Final Report for Period Beginning 12-Aug-2013 and Ending 11-Nov-2019

Title: Moral Schemas, Cultural Conflict, and Socio-Political Action

Begin Performance Period: 12-Aug-2013

End Performance Period: 11-Nov-2019

Report Term: 0-Other

Submitted By: Steven Hitlin

Email: steven-hitlin@uiowa.edu

Phone: (319) 335-2499

Distribution Statement: 1-Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.

STEM Degrees: 3

STEM Participants: 8

Major Goals: Major Goals

- Preliminary Moral Conflict Pilot Survey
- Cross-Cultural (US and Turkey) Moral Conflict Survey
- Additional Cross-Cultural (France, South Korea) Moral Conflict Survey
- Construct 4-country database, Codebook
- Analyze Data for Article Submissions
- Gather fMRI data (50 scans each) across 2 countries
 - U.S. and Istanbul
- Analyze and Publish Cross-Cultural fMRI data

Accomplishments: Major Goals

- Preliminary Moral Conflict Pilot Survey ACCOMPLISHED
- Cross-Cultural (US and Turkey) Moral Conflict Survey ACCOMPLISHED
- Additional Cross-Cultural (France, South Korea) Moral Conflict Survey ACCOMPLISHED
- Construct 4-country database, Codebook ACCOMPLISHED
- Analyze Data for Article Submissions IN PROGRESS, PARTLY ACCOMPLISHED
- Gather fMRI data (50 scans each) across 2 countries 75% ACCOMPLISHED
 - U.S. and Istanbul
- Analyze and Publish Cross-Cultural fMRI data TO BE PERFORMED

RPPR Final Report

as of 16-May-2020

Training Opportunities: Post-Doctoral Training

-Rengin Firat

Pre-Doctoral Training

-Hye Won Kwon

-Leia Belt

-Dustin Lee

-Deniz Buyukgok

Undergraduate Training

-Natalie Veldhouse

-Daniel Chung

-Makenna Yonash

-Myah Rhodes

(for what it is worth, Belt, Yonash and Rhodes are underrepresented minority students)

Results Dissemination: In addition to the papers, chapters, and talks listed, we have 3 political presentations that are difficult to categorize (2 uploaded as 'conference papers..'):

2016 Firat, Rengin, Brief presented to Congressional Staff: Multi-level Approaches to Polarization and Conflict

2016 Firat, Rengin, Brief presented to Congressman Buddy Carter on the Minerva project: Moral Schemas, Cultural Conflict, and Socio-political Action

Daniel Chung and Natalie Veldhouse, "What social factors predict In-group and out-group selection?" "Research in the Capitol" Undergraduate Presentation Series to the Iowa State Legislature. March

Honors and Awards: Advisor, Daniel Chung & Natalie Veldhouse, 5th Iowa Undergraduate Research Festival, "What social factors predict In-group and out-group selection?" (Winner: "Distinguished Poster Presentation", December)

Protocol Activity Status:

Technology Transfer: Nothing to Report

PARTICIPANTS:

Participant Type: Co-Investigator

Participant: Rengin Firat

Person Months Worked: 15.00

Funding Support:

Project Contribution:

International Collaboration:

International Travel:

National Academy Member: N

Other Collaborators:

Participant Type: Graduate Student (research assistant)

Participant: Hye Won Kwon

Person Months Worked: 15.00

Funding Support:

Project Contribution:

International Collaboration:

International Travel:

National Academy Member: N

Other Collaborators:

RPPR Final Report
as of 16-May-2020

Participant Type: Graduate Student (research assistant)

Participant: Leia Belt

Person Months Worked: 12.00

Funding Support:

Project Contribution:

International Collaboration:

International Travel:

National Academy Member: N

Other Collaborators:

Participant Type: Graduate Student (research assistant)

Participant: Dustin Lee

Person Months Worked: 13.00

Funding Support:

Project Contribution:

International Collaboration:

International Travel:

National Academy Member: N

Other Collaborators:

Participant Type: Graduate Student (research assistant)

Participant: Deniz Buyukgok

Person Months Worked: 10.00

Funding Support:

Project Contribution:

International Collaboration:

International Travel:

National Academy Member: N

Other Collaborators:

CONFERENCE PAPERS:

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation

Publication Status: 3-Accepted

Conference Name: the Annual Scientific Meeting of the International Society of Political Psychology

Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Jul-2016 Date Published:

Conference Location: Warsaw, Poland

Paper Title: "A Cross-Cultural Investigation of Altruistic Value Boundaries and Well-being.

Authors: Hye Won Kwon, Rengin B. Firat

Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation

Publication Status: 0-Other

Conference Name: International Society for Quality-of-Life Studies

Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Aug-2016 Date Published:

Conference Location: Seoul, South Korea

Paper Title: Implications of Identifying with Benevolent, Caring Groups for Social Well-Being." Paper presented at the annual conference of the International Society for Quality-of-Life Studies

Authors: Kwon, Hye Won, Rengin B. Firat

Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

RPPR Final Report
as of 16-May-2020

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Annual Meeting of the Midwest Sociological Society
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-May-2016 Date Published:
Conference Location: Chicago, IL
Paper Title: Cross-Cultural Approaches to Social Stratification in Psychological Resources: Sense of Control and Grit
Authors: Hye Won Kwon
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Departmental Colloquium, Department of Sociology
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Sep-2017 Date Published:
Conference Location: Iowa City, IA
Paper Title: The Sociology of Grit: Cross-Cultural Approaches to Social Stratification.
Authors: Hye Won Kwon
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 3-Accepted
Conference Name: Annual Meeting of the Midwest Sociological Society
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Mar-2018 Date Published:
Conference Location: Minneapolis, MN
Paper Title: We are Nice People, But They are Not": A Cross-Cultural Examination of Distinctions between In- and Out-Groups.
Authors: Hye Won Kwon, Steven Hitlin
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Annual Meeting of the International Association for Cross-Cultural Psychology
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Aug-2016 Date Published:
Conference Location: Nagoya, Japan
Paper Title: Moral Inclusion and Social Identities: A cross-national investigation of in-group and out-group values
Authors: Rengin B. Firat, Hye Won Kwon and Steven Hitlin
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 1-Published
Conference Name: Brain Processes Involved in Political Decisions Session at the Annual Meeting of the International Society of Political Psychology
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Aug-2016 Date Published:
Conference Location: Warsaw, Poland
Paper Title: Investigating Moral Conflict and Political Decisions in the Human Brain
Authors: Rengin Firat
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Penn St. Dept. of Sociology Colloquium
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Nov-2015 Date Published:
Conference Location: State College, PA
Paper Title: Values and Moral Boundaries
Authors: Steven Hitlin, Rengin Firat, Hye Won Kwon
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

RPPR Final Report
as of 16-May-2020

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Human Aspects of the Operational Environment.” 7th Int. Conference on Applied Human Factors & Ergonomics & Affiliated
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 01-Jul-2016 Date Published:
Conference Location: Orlando, FL
Paper Title: Cultural Consistency and Variation in Moral Boundaries Governing Decision-Making & Interaction: Measuring Group Values
Authors: Steven Hitlin, Rengin B. Firat, Hye Won Kwon
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Duke University Culture and Social Psychology Group
Date Received: 04-May-2020 Conference Date: 16-Jan-2017 Date Published:
Conference Location: Durham, NC
Paper Title: Moral Boundaries across Cultures
Authors: Steven Hitlin, Rengin Firat, Hye Won Kwon
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 4-Under Review
Conference Name: American Sociological Association
Date Received: 04-May-2020 Conference Date: 09-Aug-2018 Date Published:
Conference Location: Philadelphia, PA
Paper Title: Groupness: Identity and Moral Boundaries across Cultures
Authors: Steven Hitlin, Rengin B. Firat, Hye Won Kwon
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: University of Nevada, Reno Graduate Program in Social Psychology
Date Received: 01-May-2020 Conference Date: 15-Apr-2019 Date Published:
Conference Location: Reno, NV
Paper Title: Groupness: Identity and Moral Boundaries across Cultures
Authors: Steven Hitlin, Rengin B. Firat, Hye Won Kwon
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Brief to Congressman Buddy Carter
Date Received: 15-May-2020 Conference Date: 16-Oct-2016 Date Published:
Conference Location: Atlanta, GA
Paper Title: Moral Schemas, Cultural Conflict, and Soci-Political Action
Authors: Rengin Firat, Steven Hitlin
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

Publication Type: Conference Paper or Presentation **Publication Status:** 0-Other
Conference Name: Congressional Briefing, GA State Delegation
Date Received: 15-May-2020 Conference Date: 17-Oct-2016 Date Published:
Conference Location: Atlanta, GA
Paper Title: Multi-Level Approaches to Polarization & Conflict
Authors: Rengin Firat
Acknowledged Federal Support: **Y**

RPPR Final Report
as of 16-May-2020

Project Summary and Success Analysis

This is a brief summary and evaluation of the project, *Moral Schemas, Cultural Conflict, and Socio-Political Action*. Overall, we have done an adequate job of meeting our original goals, performing much more strongly with respect to Phase One than Phase Two. An overview can hopefully help Minerva staff learn from the successes and missed opportunities within our project.

The international surveys in Phase One were successfully developed, piloted, translated, quantified, cleaned up and analyzed over the course of the grant. We've published two quantitative papers out of that data, with three more under review/almost under review. We anticipate a few more papers developing out of that data in the future.

Phase Two, largely the international collaboration of the fMRI portion of the project, is where we ran into the most challenges. This cross-national collaboration represented potentially the most interesting aspect of the project, and as we receive, analyze and compare our experimental data, we hope the findings are worthy of Minerva's interest. Ultimately, we gathered the full compliment of data in Istanbul, but only half of the Iowa fMRI scans that we planned on.

From this, I can offer some insights about a) the challenges of combining sociological and neurological methodologies within institutional bureaucracies, b) positive outcomes at The University of Iowa due to the particular cross-national struggles of this grant, and c) some general views about the difficulties of transnational research in predominantly Muslim countries, potentially under the aegis of DoD funding.

Phase Two encountered literally years of bureaucratic confusion at both The University of Iowa and in communication with Istanbul University. Subcontracting out to a non-traditional country lead to a host of issues outside of the academic enterprise. The University of Iowa, for example, had no dedicated post-award support for the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences. Departments that depend on grants have their own pre- and post-award support, but departments like Sociology did not have help. That meant that previous departmental administrators managed funds and communication across Iowa and Istanbul University, which has its own peculiarities with managing grant funding coming from the U.S.

One positive benefit of this delay is that the University of Iowa has a dedicated post-award support staff. The implementation of this resource about 18 months ago helped us to dig out of many of the problems that had delayed us to that point, so for future Iowa projects, this can hopefully proceed more smoothly.

With the aid of this new position, we identified how to handle unforeseen delays in the execution of the subaward contract. Istanbul University uses an intermediary to process their payments. When the subaward was originally executed, Istanbul was working with Genomist Genom Bilimleri to receive and process financial payments. During the project, they changed to MDX to process financial payments, due to local rules about public universities accepting foreign money. As we understand it, we cannot pay Istanbul University directly, so they have set up companies to handle these payments, and university faculty and staff also are affiliated with these companies. Confusion about this, and a lack of dedicated staff who took point on figuring out what was needed, delayed the financial – and thus the academic, IRB, and staffing – aspects of Phase Two. The University of Iowa required execute of a new subaward to process their final payment to the second Turkish company. The complexities of this arrangement, transitions in university grant administrative staff, and back and forth communication with Istanbul University, delayed the proper execution of the subaward. After getting that ironed out, there was an additional complication with MDX's DUNS number getting registered with Sam.gov.

We have (at the individual and institutional level) learned a great deal about the challenges of navigating foreign collaborations, as well as the intricacies of fMRI recruitment from a closed population (defined by Phase One). A significant portion of our sample who volunteered to be contacted were not qualified for the experiment due to having taken antidepressants within a prescribed time frame. This made our recruitment crush unexpectedly difficult. This is an important challenge for socially oriented fMRI research, in which we do not simply sample the first people we can contact, but have a strategy aimed at increasing generalizability; not the concern of much social neuroscience. Biometric methods merged with social science sampling is, to say the least, difficult. Our original screening did not fully anticipate this, and while our IRB approach covered these issues, there are elevated concerns when linking biomedical methods to obtaining individual opinions and perceptions. This may be expanded when trying to link our study to one funded by the Defense Department in Turkey, likely contributing to some of the local trouble obtaining necessary permissions on their end.

Future cross-national projects would be facilitated by having universities work through such financial transaction procedures early in the process, if not in the application, itself. In our case, we had buy-in from the academic researchers in both locations, as well as Sponsored Programs at Iowa, but the difficulties of subawards, and the legal peculiarities of the Turkish system, came to light too late in the process to keep the study moving along on our original timeline.

These delays led to two additional complications at Iowa. First, the multi-year delay meant that co-Investigator Firat had to step back in terms of overseeing the implementation of the fMRI portion of Phase Two, after successfully designing and piloting the protocol. She had to focus on her tenure track position and was only able to advise from afar. Second, the PI (Hitlin) had children in 2017 and 2019, after the original grant was supposed to have been completed but contributed to a lack of surplus time. Family planning is likely outside of the scope of Minerva funding decisions, but it is part of the story of this project.

Adding to what seems to be a comedy of circumstances, we had a human error in the Spring of 2019 (an email solicitation error on the part of one of our Research Assistants), an IRB breach that we immediately alerted ARMY IRB and Iowa IRB and rectified, but that further delayed our start. This was followed by the Iowa Magnetic Resonance laboratory TWICE buying new, updated equipment that necessitated us hiring outside help to update our experimental programming. When we learned we would not be receiving another no-cost extension in September, we obtained as many scans as possible in the ensuing two months. I am pleased, in the face of all of this, that we got to 25 scans, enough to meaningfully compare with Istanbul data, and a large number for neurological work, even as the social scientist in me cringes.