

AD-A062 952

ECODYNAMICS RESEARCH ASSOCIATES INC ALBUQUERQUE NM  
A SIXTH-ORDER ACCURATE DIRECT SOLVER FOR THE POISSON AND HELMHOLTZ (U)  
OCT 78 P J ROACHE

F/G 12/1

N00014-76-C-0636

NL

UNCLASSIFIED

| OF |  
AD  
A0 62952



END  
DATE  
FILMED  
3 --79  
DDC

AD A062952

DDC FILE COPY

LEVEL II (12)

A SIXTH-ORDER ACCURATE DIRECT SOLVER FOR THE POISSON AND HELMHOLTZ EQUATIONS.

(10) Patrick J. Roache

(9) Technical rept.

Ecodynamics Research Associates, Inc.  
P.O. Box 8172  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87198

(11) October 1978

Research Sponsored by the Office of Naval Research

(15) under Contract N00014-76-C-0636

Task Number NR 061-224

(12) 20P.  
DDC  
JAN 8 1979  
REGISTERED  
OFF

Approved for Public Release; Distribution unlimited.  
Reproduction in whole or in part is permitted for any purpose of the United States Government.

79 01 05 0:0

5/c  
392 722

502

SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE (When Data Entered)

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE		READ INSTRUCTIONS BEFORE COMPLETING FORM
1. REPORT NUMBER	2. GOVT ACCESSION NO.	3. RECIPIENT'S CATALOG NUMBER
4. TITLE (and Subtitle) A Sixth-Order Accurate Direct Solver for the Poisson and Helmholtz Equations		5. TYPE OF REPORT & PERIOD COVERED Technical Report October 1978
7. AUTHOR(s) Patrick J. Roache		6. PERFORMING ORG. REPORT NUMBER N00014-76-C-0636
8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS Ecodynamics Res. Assoc. Inc., PO. Box 8172 Albuquerque, NM 87198		9. CONTRACT OR GRANT NUMBER(s)
11. CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS ONR (Code 438) Arlington, Virginia 22217		10. PROGRAM ELEMENT, PROJECT, TASK AREA & WORK UNIT NUMBERS
14. MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS (if different from Controlling Office)		12. REPORT DATE October 1978
		13. NUMBER OF PAGES 10
		15. SECURITY CLASS. (of this report) unclassified
		15a. DECLASSIFICATION/DOWNGRADING SCHEDULE
16. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of this Report) Approved for public release; distribution unlimited.		
17. DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report)		
18. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES		
19. KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) Computational Methods Fluid Dynamics Modeling High Order Methods		
20. ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) An $O(h^6)$ accurate direct solver is described for a class of separable elliptic equations in $(r, \theta)$ coordinates with periodic conditions in $\theta$ . A discrete Fourier transform is used in $\theta$ , and the Hermite 6 discretization of Rubin and Khosla is used in $r$ . A single deferred correction at boundary points gives the $O(h^6)$ accuracy, in $O(N^2 \ln N)$ operations for an $N \times N$ problem.		

9 01 05 033

TO APPEAR IN AIAA JOURNAL

A SIXTH-ORDER ACCURATE DIRECT SOLVER FOR THE  
POISSON AND HELMHOLTZ EQUATIONS

Patrick J. Roache \*

Ecodynamics Research Associates, Inc.

Albuquerque, New Mexico

ADVIS	W	OR	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
DDC	Buff Section		<input type="checkbox"/>
UNANNOUNCED			<input type="checkbox"/>
JUSTIFICATION			
BY			
DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY CODES			
		SPECIAL	
A			

INTRODUCTION

The Poisson and Helmholtz equations are some of the most common and important equations of mathematical physics. Their solution is required in subsonic aerodynamics problems, in steady-state heat conduction problems, and in electric field calculations, as well as other areas. While iterative methods are easy to code and are flexible, they are notoriously slow in converging for large meshes. Beginning with Hockney's paper<sup>1</sup> in 1965, direct (non-iterative) methods are now frequently used because of their great speed advantage. A complete review of direct methods would require a large review paper, since this field has become very active in recent years. Almost all the methods published to date are limited to second-order accuracy, i.e. the truncation error is  $O(h^2)$  where  $h$  is the mesh spacing. An exception is Ref. 2, which presents a method that is  $O(h^4)$  but is limited to the constant-coefficient equation in cartesian coordinates.

In the present paper, a direct solver is described for a class of separable elliptic equations in  $(r, \theta)$  coordinates which is  $O(h^6)$  accurate provided that the problem is periodic in  $\theta$ . As in Hockney's method<sup>1</sup>, a discrete Fourier transform is used in  $\theta$ . In  $r$ , the Hermite 6 discretization of Rubin and Khosla<sup>3</sup> is used, giving  $O(\Delta r^6)$  accuracy at interior points. The basic equation used at boundary points is  $O(\Delta r^4)$  but is corrected in a

Index category: Computational Methods.

\* Member, AIAA.

single deferred correction step to  $O(h^6)$  accuracy.

#### THE METHOD

The following elliptic equation is solved directly, with periodic boundary conditions in  $\theta$  and combinations of Dirichlet (function) and Neumann (gradient) conditions in  $r$ . Subscripts indicate partial derivatives.

$$a(r)\psi_{rr} + b(r)\psi_r + c(r)\psi + \psi_{\theta\theta} = d(r,\theta) \quad (1)$$

With the proper choice of  $a$ - $d$ , this equation can represent the Poisson or Helmholtz equation in cartesian, polar, elliptic, biaxial, or parabolic cylinder coordinates, including an arbitrary coordinate transformation in  $r$ . The only requirement, which will be imposed by the use of the Fast Fourier Transform (FFT) in  $\theta$ , is that the coefficients be separable and the  $\theta$ -term is simply  $\psi_{\theta\theta}$ . (An arbitrary constant can be absorbed by scaling, of course.) Other coordinates may not meet these requirements, e.g. spherical, prolate spheroidal, oblate spheroidal, toroidal, bipolar, and paraboloidal<sup>4</sup>. An important system which does meet these requirements is the conformal coordinate system for Joukowski airfoils used by Mehta<sup>5</sup> to approximate real airfoils.

The discrete Fourier transform is applied to (1) using the FFT algorithm. This transforms the variable  $\psi(r,\theta)$  to  $\hat{\psi}(r,k)$  where  $k$  is the wave-number in the  $\theta$ -direction. As in Ref. 1, this gives

$$a(r)\hat{\psi}_{rr} + b(r)\hat{\psi}_r + (c(r) - k^2/4)\hat{\psi} = \hat{d}(r,k) \quad (2)$$

where  $\hat{d}(r,k)$  is the discrete Fourier transform of  $d(r,\theta)$ . Eqn. (2) is now a decoupled system of ordinary differential equations in  $r$  (with  $k$  as a parameter) which is solved by Hermite 6 discretization<sup>3</sup>. A final backward FFT then gives  $\psi$ .

In the notation of Ref. 3, Eqn. (2) is re-written with  $u \equiv \hat{\psi}$ ,  $m \equiv u_r$ , and  $M \equiv u_{rr}$ , as

$$AM + Bm + Cu = D \quad (3)$$

where  $A$ - $D$  are obvious shorter notations for the coefficients in Eqn. (2).

The Hermite 6 discretization provides two more equations, as follows.

The index  $j$  is the index for the discrete node points in  $r$ , equally spaced  $h$  apart.

$$M_{j+1} - 8M_j + M_{j-1} = -\frac{24}{h^2}(u_{j+1} - 2u_j + u_{j-1}) + \frac{9}{h}(m_{j+1} - m_{j-1}) \quad (4)$$

$$7m_{j+1} + 16m_j + 7m_{j-1} = \frac{15}{h}(u_{j+1} - u_{j-1}) + h(M_{j+1} - M_{j-1}) \quad (5)$$

Eqns. (3), (4) and (5) are three equations in the three unknowns  $u, m, M$ .

Since Eqn. (3) applies at all points, we can write it at index values  $j$  and  $j \pm 1$  and use it to eliminate all  $M$ 's from Eqns. (4) and (5), giving

$$\begin{aligned} & -\left(\frac{9}{h} + \frac{B_{j-1}}{A_{j-1}}\right) m_{j-1} + \left(8\frac{B_j}{A_j}\right) m_j - \left(\frac{9}{h} + \frac{B_{j+1}}{A_{j+1}}\right) m_{j+1} \\ & -\left(\frac{C_{j-1}}{A_{j-1}} - \frac{24}{h^2}\right) u_{j-1} + \left(8\frac{C_j}{A_j} - \frac{48}{h^2}\right) u_j - \left(\frac{C_{j+1}}{A_{j+1}} - \frac{24}{h^2}\right) u_{j+1} \\ & = -\frac{D_{j-1}}{A_{j-1}} + 8\frac{D_j}{A_j} - \frac{D_{j+1}}{A_{j+1}} \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

$$\begin{aligned} & -\left(h\frac{B_{j-1}}{A_{j-1}} - 7\right) m_{j-1} + 16m_j - \left(-h\frac{B_{j+1}}{A_{j+1}} - 7\right) m_{j+1} \\ & -\left(h\frac{C_{j-1}}{A_{j-1}} - \frac{15}{h}\right) u_{j-1} - \left(-h\frac{C_{j+1}}{A_{j+1}} + \frac{15}{h}\right) u_{j+1} \\ & = -h\frac{D_{j-1}}{A_{j-1}} + h\frac{D_{j+1}}{A_{j+1}} \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

If boundary values of  $u$  and  $m$  are known, Eqns. (6) and (7) constitute a  $2 \times 2$  block-tridiagonal system of linear equations. However, the boundary values of both  $u$  and  $m$  cannot be given, since that would overspecify the continuum problem. The difficulty in most high-order accuracy methods is to find a consistently high-order boundary formulation. If conventional one-sided differences are used to evaluate  $m$  at boundaries, the band-width of the

system is greatly increased, leading to inefficiency and increasing the accumulation of round-off error. Instead, we utilize Eqn. (19b) of Rubin and Khosla<sup>3</sup>, written at the left-hand boundary  $j = 1$  as

$$u_2 - u_1 - \frac{h}{2}(m_2 + m_1) + \frac{h^2}{12}(M_2 - M_1) = G_1 \quad (8)$$

where

$$G_1 = \frac{h^5}{720} (u^V)_1 + \frac{h^6}{1440} (u^{VI})_1 \quad (9)$$

where  $(u^V)$  and  $(u^{VI})$  are the fifth- and sixth-derivatives in  $r$ . Again using Eqn. (3) to eliminate  $M$ 's from Eqn.(8), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} & \left(\frac{h^2}{12} \frac{B_1}{A_1} - \frac{h}{2}\right) m_1 - \left(\frac{h}{2} + \frac{h^2}{12} \frac{B_2}{A_2}\right) m_2 \\ & + \left(\frac{h^2}{12} \frac{C_1}{A_1} - 1\right) u_1 - \left(\frac{h^2}{12} \frac{C_2}{A_2} - 1\right) u_2 = \frac{h^2}{12} \left(\frac{D_1}{A_1} - \frac{D_2}{A_2}\right) + G_1 \end{aligned} \quad (10)$$

The analogous equation at the right boundary  $j=JL$  is

$$\begin{aligned} & \left(\frac{h}{2} - \frac{h^2}{12} \frac{B_{JL-1}}{A_{JL-1}}\right) m_{JL-1} + \left(\frac{h}{2} + \frac{h^2}{12} \frac{B_{JL}}{A_{JL}}\right) m_{JL} \\ & - \left(\frac{h^2}{12} \frac{C_{JL-1}}{A_{JL-1}} - 1\right) u_{JL-1} + \left(\frac{h^2}{12} \frac{C_{JL}}{A_{JL}} - 1\right) u_{JL} \\ & = \frac{h^2}{12} \left(\frac{D_{JL}}{A_{JL}} - \frac{D_{JL-1}}{A_{JL-1}}\right) + G_{JL} \end{aligned} \quad (11)$$

where

$$G_{JL} = - \frac{h^5}{720} (u^V)_{JL} + \frac{h^6}{1440} (u^{VI})_{JL} \quad (12)$$

If  $G_1$  and  $G_{JL}$  are known, the system of equations (6), (7), (10) and (11) constitute a  $2 \times 2$  block-tridiagonal system which is an  $O(h^6)$  approximation to Eqn. (2). Since  $G_1$  and  $G_{JL}$  are actually unknown, we obtain the solution by deferred corrections as follows.

Using the bi-tridiagonal algorithm of von Rosenberg<sup>6</sup> or another banded matrix solver, we obtain a first solution to the system with  $G_1 = G_{JL} = 0$ .

From Eqns. (8) and (9), it is clear that this gives an initial solution  $u^0$  which is formally  $O(h^4)$  accurate. Based on  $u^0$ , we evaluate  $G_1$  and  $G_{JL}$  using conventional one-sided 7-point differences<sup>7</sup> for  $u^v$  and  $u^{vi}$  as follows.

$$h^5(u^v)_1 = (-21 u_1 + 120 u_2 - 285 u_3 + 360 u_4 - 255 u_5 + 96 u_6 - 15 u_7)/6 \quad (13a)$$

$$h^5(u^v)_{JL} = (15 u_{JL-6} - 96 u_{JL-5} + 255 u_{JL-4} - 360 u_{JL-3} + 285 u_{JL-2} - 120 u_{JL-1} + 21 u_{JL})/6 \quad (13b)$$

$$h^6(u^{vi})_1 = u_1 - 6 u_2 + 15 u_3 - 20 u_4 + 15 u_5 - 6 u_6 + u_7 \quad (13c)$$

$$h^6(u^{vi})_{JL} = u_{JL-6} - 6 u_{JL-5} + 15 u_{JL-4} - 20 u_{JL-3} + 15 u_{JL-2} - 6 u_{JL-1} + u_{JL} \quad (13d)$$

These values are used in Eqns. (10) and (11) and the solution is repeated. The process can be continued until convergence. However, since  $u^v$  from Eqns. (13a,b) are already  $O(h^2)$  accurate and  $u^{vi}$  from Eqns. (13c,d) are already  $O(h)$  accurate, it is clear from Eqns. (9-12) that the first corrected solution to  $u$  is already  $O(h^6)$  accurate, so the method with a single correction can be termed "direct".

Although the requirement for a bi-tridiagonal solution is more expensive of computer time than the scalar tridiagonal solution required for  $O(h^2)$  accuracy, and although the present method requires a correction step, the operation count is the same order as Hockney's method<sup>1</sup>. That is, the operation count for the FFT's with  $N$  nodes in  $\theta$  is  $O(N \ln N)$  if  $N-1 = 2^p$ , and the two-dimensional solution for  $N \times N$  nodes is then obtained in  $O(N^2 \ln N)$  operations. It should be noted that the deferred correction step is done within a solution for a Fourier component, so that the FFT operations are not repeated for the corrections.

Also, most of the coefficients of the 2x2 system need not be re-evaluated for the correction step(s).

If more than one deferred correction step is used, round-off error may cause the iterations to diverge unless the corrections are under-relaxed.

For one correction, we use

$$G_1^1, G_{JL}^1 = \text{function}(u^0) \quad (14a)$$

but for more correction steps, we use

$$G_1^n, G_{JL}^n = \text{function}\left(\frac{1}{2}u^{n-1} + \frac{1}{2}u^{n-2}\right) \quad (14b)$$

#### NUMERICAL VERIFICATION

The code incorporating this method has been tested on a variety of two-dimensional as well as one-dimensional problems, and is designed to handle arbitrary user-specified coefficients a-d in Eqn. (1). Representative results are presented here for the simple equation

$$\psi_{rr} + \psi_{\theta\theta} = d, \quad 0 \leq r \leq 2\pi, \quad 0 \leq \theta \leq 2\pi \quad (15)$$

for two cases,

$$d_a = -\frac{1}{2}\sin(r) \sin(\theta) \quad (16a)$$

which gives the solution  $\psi(r, \theta) = \sin(r) \sin(\theta)$ , and

$$d_b = -\frac{1}{2}\cos(r) \cos(\theta) \quad (16b)$$

which gives the solution  $\psi(r, \theta) = \cos(r) \cos(\theta)$ . These two test cases give different behavior because the solution to (16a) gives  $u^v = 0$  at boundaries, while Eqn. (16b) gives  $u^v = u^{vi} = 0$  at boundaries. These are useful for isolating the effect of the deferred corrections for  $G_1$  and  $G_{JL}$ .

The numerical tests were performed on a time-shared CDC 6600 NOS System. The computer has 14<sup>+</sup> significant decimal figures of word length. With only mesh sizes of the form  $N - 1 = 2^P$  considered, the largest problem which fits into the 34,752 word central memory allocation is a 65x65 node problem.

The truncation-error convergence for the test cases is shown in Table 1.

For both test problems (16a) and (16b), the maximum error in the solution  $E$  is presented for cases of no deferred correction ( $L_c = 0$ ), one deferred correction ( $L_c = 1$ ) and  $L_c = 10$ , for meshes ranging from  $9 \times 9$  to  $65 \times 65$  ( $p = 3$  to  $6$ ). The maximum error  $E$  is seen to decrease very rapidly, as expected. A more precise evaluation is obtained by inspection of the tabulated values of  $E/h^4$ ,  $E/h^5$ , etc. In the idealized case of no round-off error and  $h \rightarrow 0$ , the value of  $E/h^5$  will become constant for an  $s$ -order accurate method as  $h$  decreases.

Part (a) of Table 1 shows the performance for the uncorrected method. Although formally only  $O(h^4)$  accurate, it is seen that the actual performance is closer to  $O(h^5)$  since the value of  $E/h^5$  increases only from  $3.04 \times 10^{-2}$  to  $3.86 \times 10^{-2}$  as  $p$  varies from 4 to 6, for the more difficult test case (16a). Part (b) of Table 1 shows the performance for the method with a single deferred correction. Formally, the method is  $O(h^6)$  accurate, and this is indicated by the values of  $E/h^6$  which for the worse case (16a) are nearly constant, increasing only 21% as  $p$  increases from 4 to 6. However, the single deferred correction is not as accurate as a fully iterated solution, such as that shown in Part (c) of Figure 1 for 10 corrections. This shows  $E/h^6$  decreasing significantly for both test cases, indicating convergence at better than  $O(h^6)$ .

Also shown in Table 1 are timing tests, obtained on a CDC 6600 NOS System using FORTRAN IV with Level 2 optimization. The CPU time shown is the average of at least three runs, and does not include I/O. An optimal method will have an operation count for an  $N \times N$  problem proportional to  $N^2$ , so that the value of  $(\text{CPU time})/N^2$  would be a constant. The present method has a sub-optimal operation count proportional to  $N^2 \ln N$ , so we would expect  $(\text{CPU time})/N^2$  to increase with  $N$ . However, there is evidently enough overhead operations in the program to mask this behavior over the range of  $N$  tested, since  $(\text{CPU time})/N^2$  increases only slightly with  $N$  in Table 2. (If we consider only the unknowns at interior nodes,  $(\text{CPU time})/(N-2)^2$  actually decreases.) The time difference between the  $O(h^4)$  solution with no correction and the  $O(h^6)$

solution with one correction is only about 35% for  $N = 9$  and decreases slightly for increasing  $N$ .

#### DISCUSSION

A direct method for obtaining  $O(h^6)$  accurate solutions of a class of separable elliptic equations with periodic boundary conditions in one direction has been presented and verified. The method as presently coded uses the constant-mesh-spacing version of Hermite 6 discretization of Rubin and Khosla<sup>3</sup>. However, it should be noted that the Hermite 6 equations as given in Ref. 3 are actually more general, allowing for variable  $h$  with  $O(h^5)$  accuracy. Shear layer resolution can be achieved in the present code, since the form of Eqn. (1) allows for arbitrary coordinate stretching in  $r$ ; however, the variable- $h$  equations would be useful for self-adaptive mesh solutions. Another advantage of the compact formulas such as Hermite 6 is that both the function and its first derivative ( $u$  and  $m$  in Eqns. 3-11) appear explicitly. It is thus very easy to set accurate boundary conditions on the gradient, which is more difficult in conventional high-order differencing. Further, the numerical oscillations associated with high cell Reynolds numbers are mitigated by the use of compact forms<sup>3</sup>. The advantages of high order methods are well known, provided that high accuracy is indeed required for the problem at hand. Good candidates for sixth-order methods are problems which involve fluid stability calculations. The direct solver described above is currently being used in studies of time-dependent vortex shedding from oscillating cylinders.

On a less optimistic consideration, we note: (1) it will be difficult to actually realize  $O(h^6)$  accuracy in real aerodynamics problems with ambiguities in far-field computational boundary conditions; (2) high formal accuracy does not solve resolution problems associated with the thin shear layers of high Reynolds number problems (e.g., see Ref. 8).

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author gratefully acknowledges the advice of Profs. S. G. Rubin and P.K. Khosla. This work was supported by the Fluid Dynamics Program of the Office of Naval Research under contract N00014-76-C-0636.

-9-  
References

- <sup>1</sup> Hockney, R. W., "A Fast Direct Solution of Poisson's Equation Using Fourier Analysis", J. Assoc. Comput. Mach., Vol. 12, No.1, Jan. 1965, pp. 95-113.
- <sup>2</sup> Shaanan, S. and Ferziger, J.H., A Direct Method of Solution of Poisson Equation Accurate to Fourth Order, Report TF-3, Thermosciences Division, Dept. of Mechanical Engineering, Stanford University, Calif., August 1974.
- <sup>3</sup> Rubin, S.G. and Khosla, P.K., "Polynomial Interpolation Methods for Viscous Flow Calculations", J. Comp. Phys., Vol. 24, No. 3, July 1977, pp. 217-244.
- <sup>4</sup> Schelkunoff, S. A., Applied Mathematics for Engineers and Scientists, 2nd Ed., D. Van Nostrand, Princeton, New Jersey, 1965, Chapter VIII.
- <sup>5</sup> Mehta, U. B., "Dynamic Stall of an Oscillating Airfoil", Paper No. 23, AGARD Fluid Dynamics Panel Symposium on Unsteady Aerodynamics, Ottawa, Sept. 1977.
- <sup>6</sup> von Rosenberg, D. U., Methods for the Numerical Solution of Partial Differential Equations, American Elsevier, New York, 1969, Appendix C.
- <sup>7</sup> Southwell, R.V., Relaxation Methods in Theoretical Physics, Oxford at the Clarendon Press, 1946, Table V.
- <sup>8</sup> Roache, P. J., "A Pseudo-Spectral FFT Technique for Non-Periodic Problems", J. Comp. Phys. Vol. 27, No. 2, May 1978, pp. 204-220.

Part	Eqn.	p	Mesh NxN	Lc	E	E/h <sup>4</sup>	E/h <sup>5</sup>	E/h <sup>6</sup>	CPU time (sec)	CPU time/N <sup>2</sup> (msec)	
a	16a	3	9x9	0	.637-03	.167-02	.213-02		0.037	0.457	
		4	17x17	0	.284-04	.119-02	.304-02		0.135	0.467	
		5	33x33	0	.104-05	.702-03	.357-02		0.519	0.477	
		6	65x65	0	.352-07	.379-03	.386-02		2.063	0.488	
	16b	3	9x9	0	.283-03	.743-03	.947-03	.121-02	same as Eqn. 16a		
		4	17x17	0	.581-05	.244-03	.622-03	.159-02	"		
		5	33x33	0	.104-06	.702-04	.356-03	.182-02	"		
		6	65x65	0	.174-08	.188-04	.191-03	.195-02	"		
	b	16a	3	9x9	1	.188-03		.799-03	.050	0.050	0.617
			4	17x17	1	.858-05		.234-02	.182	0.182	0.630
			5	33x33	1	.147-06		.257-02	0.694	0.694	0.637
			6	65x65	1	.253-08		.282-02	2.737	2.737	0.648
16b		3	9x9	1	.953-03		.406-02	same as Eqn. 16a			
		4	17x17	1	.938-05		.256-02	"			
c		5	33x33	1	.518-07		.904-03	"			
		6	65x65	1	.280-09		.312-03	"			
	16a	3	9x9	10	.205-03		.873-03	0.174	0.174	2.148	
		4	17x17	10	.699-05		.190-02	0.609	0.609	2.107	
		5	33x33	10	.950-07		.166-02	2.276	2.276	2.090	
		6	65x65	10	.874-09		.976-03	8.805	8.805	2.084	
	16b	3	9x9	10	.897-03		.382-02	same as Eqn. 16a			
		4	17x17	10	.872-05		.238-02	"			
		5	33x33	10	.450-07		.785-03	"			
		6	65x65	10	.191-09		.213-03	"			

Table 1. Performance of the direct  $O(h^6)$  elliptic solver. Lc = number of deferred corrections. E = error of the solution.  $h$  = mesh spacing in  $r$  and  $\theta$ ,  $= 2\pi/(N-1)$ . CPU times are for a FORTRAN IV program run on a time-shared CDC 6600 NOS System with Level 2 optimization. The notation .637-03 means  $0.637 \times 10^{-3}$ , etc.

DISTRIBUTION LIST FOR UNCLASSIFIED  
TECHNICAL REPORTS AND REPRINTS ISSUED UNDER  
CONTRACT NO0014-76-C-0636      TASK NR 061-224

All addresses receive one copy unless otherwise specified

Technical Library Building 313 Ballistic Research Laboratories Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005	Office of Naval Research Code 411 Arlington, VA 22217
Dr. F. D. Bennett External Ballistic Laboratory Ballistic Research Laboratories Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005	Office of Naval Research Code 421 Arlington, VA 22217
Mr. C. C. Hudson Sandia Corporation Sandia Base Albuquerque, NM 81115	Office of Naval Research Code 438 Arlington, VA 22217
Professor P. J. Roache Ecodynamics Research Associates, Inc. P. O. Box 8172 Albuquerque, NM 87108	Office of Naval Research Code 1021P (ONRL) Arlington, VA 22217 <u>6 Copies</u>
Dr. J. D. Shreve, Jr. Sandia Corporation Sandia Base Albuquerque, NM 81115	Dr. J. L. Potter Deputy Director, Technology von Karman Gas Dynamics Facility Arnold Air Force Station, TN 37389
Defense Documentation Center Cameron Station, Building 5 Alexandria, VA 22314 <u>12 Copies</u>	Professor J. C. Wu Georgia Institute of Technology School of Aerospace Engineering Atlanta, GA 30332
Library Naval Academy Annapolis, MD 21402	Library Aerojet-General Corporation 6352 North Irwindale Avenue Azusa, CA 91702
Dr. G. H. Heilmeyer Director, Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency 1400 Wilson Boulevard Arlington, VA 22209	NASA Scientific and Technical Information Facility P. O. Box 8757 Baltimore/Washington International Airport Maryland 21240
Mr. R. A. Moore Deputy Director, Tactical Technology Office Defense Advanced Research Projects Agency 1400 Wilson Boulevard Arlington, VA 22209	Dr. S. A. Berger University of California Department of Mechanical Engineering Berkeley, CA 94720
	Professor A. J. Chorin University of California Department of Mathematics Berkeley, CA 94720

79 01 05 037

Page 2

Professor M. Holt  
University of California  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Berkeley, CA 94720

Dr. L. Talbot  
University of California  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Berkeley, CA 94720

Dr. H. R. Chaplin  
Code 16  
David W. Taylor Naval Ship Research  
and Development Center  
Bethesda, MD 20084

Code 1800  
David W. Taylor Naval Ship Research  
and Development Center  
Bethesda, MD 20084

Code 5643  
David W. Taylor Naval Ship Research  
and Development Center  
Bethesda, MD 20084

Dr. G. R. Inger  
Virginia Polytechnic Institute  
and State University  
Department of Aerospace Engineering  
Blacksburg, VA 24061

Professor A. H. Nayfeh  
Virginia Polytechnic Institute  
and State University  
Department of Engineering Science  
and Mechanics  
Blacksburg, VA 24061

Indiana University  
School of Applied Mathematics  
Bloomington, IN 47401

Director  
Office of Naval Research Branch Office  
495 Summer Street  
Boston, MA 02210

Supervisor, Technical Library Section  
Thiokol Chemical Corporation  
Wasatch Division  
Brigham City, UT 84302

Dr. G. Hall  
State University of New York at Buffalo  
Faculty of Engineering and  
Applied Science  
Fluid and Thermal Sciences Laboratory  
Buffalo, NY 14214

Mr. R. J. Vidal  
Calspan Corporation  
Aerodynamics Research Department  
P. O. Box 235  
Buffalo, NY 14221

Professor R. F. Probst  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Cambridge, MA 02139

Director  
Office of Naval Research Branch Office  
536 South Clark Street  
Chicago, IL 60605

Code 753  
Naval Weapons Center  
China Lake, CA 93555

Mr. J. Marshall  
Code 4063  
Naval Weapons Center  
China Lake, CA 93555

Professor R. T. Davis  
University of Cincinnati  
Department of Aerospace Engineering  
and Applied Mechanics  
Cincinnati, OH 45221

Library MS 60-3  
NASA Lewis Research Center  
21000 Brookpark Road  
Cleveland, OH 44135

Dr. J. D. Anderson, Jr.  
Chairman, Department of Aerospace  
Engineering  
College of Engineering  
University of Maryland  
College Park, MD 20742

Professor W. L. Melnik  
University of Maryland  
Department of Aerospace Engineering  
Glenn L. Martin Institute of Technology  
College Park, MD 20742

Professor O. Burggraf  
Ohio State University  
Department of Aeronautical and  
Astronautical Engineering  
1314 Kinnear Road  
Columbus, OH 43212

Technical Library  
Naval Surface Weapons Center  
Dahlgren Laboratory  
Dahlgren, VA 22448

Dr. F. Moore  
Naval Surface Weapons Center  
Dahlgren Laboratory  
Dahlgren, VA 22448

Technical Library 2-51131  
LTV Aerospace Corporation  
P. O. Box 5907  
Dallas, TX 75222

Library, United Aircraft Corporation  
Research Laboratories  
Silver Lane  
East Hartford, CT 06108

Technical Library  
AVCO-Everett Research Laboratory  
2385 Revere Beach Parkway  
Everett, MA 02149

Professor G. Moretti  
Polytechnic Institute of New York  
Long Island Center  
Department of Aerospace Engineering  
and Applied Mechanics  
Route 110  
Farmingdale, NY 11735

Professor S. G. Rubin  
Polytechnic Institute of New York  
Long Island Center  
Department of Aerospace Engineering  
and Applied Mechanics  
Route 110  
Farmingdale, NY 11735

Technical Documents Center  
Army Mobility Equipment R&D Center  
Building 315  
Fort Belvoir, VA 22060

Dr. W. R. Briley  
Scientific Research Associates, Inc.  
P. O. Box 498  
Glastonbury, CT 06033

Library (MS 185)  
NASA Langley Research Center  
Langley Station  
Hampton, VA 23665

Dr. S. Nadir  
Northrop Corporation  
Aircraft Division  
3901 West Broadway  
Hawthorne, CA 90250

Professor A. Chapmann  
Chairman, Mechanical Engineering  
Department  
William M. Rice Institute  
Box 1892  
Houston, TX 77001

Dr. F. Lane  
KLD Associates, Inc.  
7 High Street  
Huntington, NY 11743

Technical Library  
Naval Ordnance Station  
Indian Head, MD 20640

Professor D. A. Caughey  
Cornell University  
Sibley School of Mechanical and  
Aerospace Engineering  
Ithaca, NY 14853

Professor E. L. Resler  
Cornell University  
Sibley School of Mechanical and  
Aerospace Engineering  
Ithaca, NY 14853

Professor S. F. Shen  
Cornell University  
Sibley School of Mechanical and  
Aerospace Engineering  
Ithaca, NY 14853

79 01 05 037

Page 4

Library  
Midwest Research Institute  
425 Volker Boulevard  
Kansas City, MO 64110

Dr. M. M. Hafez  
Flow Research, Inc.  
P. O. Box 5040  
Kent, WA 98031

Dr. E. M. Murman  
Flow Research, Inc.  
P. O. Box 5040  
Kent, WA 98031

Dr. S. A. Orszag  
Cambridge Hydrodynamics, Inc.  
54 Baskin Road  
Lexington, MA 02173

Professor T. Cebeci  
California State University, Long Beach  
Mechanical Engineering Department  
Long Beach, CA 90840

Mr. J. L. Hess  
Douglas Aircraft Company  
3855 Lakewood Boulevard  
Long Beach, CA 90808

Dr. H. K. Cheng  
University of Southern California,  
University Park  
Department of Aerospace Engineering  
Los Angeles, CA 90007

Professor J. D. Cole  
University of California  
Mechanics and Structures Department  
School of Engineering and Applied  
Science  
Los Angeles, CA 90024

Engineering Library  
University of Southern California  
Box 77929  
Los Angeles, CA 90007

Dr. C. -M. Ho  
University of Southern California,  
University Park  
Department of Aerospace Engineering  
Los Angeles, CA 90007

Dr. T. D. Taylor  
The Aerospace Corporation  
P. O. Box 92957  
Los Angeles, CA 90009

Commanding Officer  
Naval Ordnance Station  
Louisville, KY 40214

Mr. B. H. Little, Jr.  
Lockheed-Georgia Company  
Department 72-74, Zone 369  
Marietta, GA 30061

Dr. C. Cook  
Stanford Research Institute  
Menlo Park, CA 94025

Professor E. R. G. Eckert  
University of Minnesota  
241 Mechanical Engineering Building  
Minneapolis, MN 55455

Library  
Naval Postgraduate School  
Monterey, CA 93940

McGill University  
Supersonic-Gas Dynamics Research  
Laboratory  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Montreal 12, Quebec, Canada

Librarian  
Engineering Library, 127-223  
Radio Corporation of America  
Morristown, NJ 07960

Dr. S. S. Stahara  
Nielsen Engineering & Research, Inc.  
510 Clyde Avenue  
Mountain View, CA 94043

Engineering Societies Library  
345 East 47th Street  
New York, NY 10017

Professor A. Jameson  
New York University  
Courant Institute of Mathematical  
Sciences  
251 Mercer Street  
New York, NY 10012

Page 5

Professor G. Miller  
New York University  
Department of Applied Science  
26-36 Stuyvesant Street  
New York, NY 10003

Office of Naval Research  
New York Area Office  
715 Broadway - 5th Floor  
New York, NY 10003

Dr. A. Vaglio-Laurin  
New York University  
Department of Applied Science  
26-36 Stuyvesant Street  
New York, NY 10003

Professor S. Weinbaum  
Research Foundation of the City  
University of New York on behalf  
of the City College  
1411 Broadway  
New York, NY 10018

Librarian, Aeronautical Library  
National Research Council  
Montreal Road  
Ottawa 7, Canada

Lockheed Missiles and Space Company  
Technical Information Center  
3251 Hanover Street  
Palo Alto, CA 94304

Director  
Office of Naval Research Branch Office  
1030 East Green Street  
Pasadena, CA 91106

California Institute of Technology  
Engineering Division  
Pasadena, CA 91109

Library  
Jet Propulsion Laboratory  
4800 Oak Grove Drive  
Pasadena, CA 91103

Professor H. Liepmann  
California Institute of Technology  
Department of Aeronautics  
Pasadena, CA 91109

Mr. L. I. Chasen, MGR-MSD Lib.  
General Electric Company  
Missile and Space Division  
P. O. Box 8555  
Philadelphia, PA 19101

Mr. P. Dodge  
Airesearch Manufacturing Company  
of Arizona  
Division of Garrett Corporation  
402 South 36th Street  
Phoenix, AZ 85034

Technical Library  
Naval Missile Center  
Point Mugu, CA 93042

Professor S. Bogdonoff  
Princeton University  
Gas Dynamics Laboratory  
Department of Aerospace and  
Mechanical Sciences  
Princeton, NJ 08540

Professor S. I. Cheng  
Princeton University  
Department of Aerospace and  
Mechanical Sciences  
Princeton, NJ 08540

Dr. J. E. Yates  
Aeronautical Research Associates  
of Princeton, Inc.  
50 Washington Road  
Princeton, NJ 08540

Professor J. H. Clarke  
Brown University  
Division of Engineering  
Providence, RI 02912

Professor J. T. C. Liu  
Brown University  
Division of Engineering  
Providence, RI 02912

Professor L. Sirovich  
Brown University  
Division of Applied Mathematics  
Providence, RI 02912

Page 6

Dr. P. K. Dai (R1/2178)  
TRW Systems Group, Inc.  
One Space Park  
Redondo Beach, CA 90278

Redstone Scientific Information  
Center  
Chief, Document Section  
Army Missile Command  
Redstone Arsenal, AL 35809

U.S. Army Research Office  
P. O. Box 12211  
Research Triangle, NC 27709

Professor M. Lessen  
The University of Rochester  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
River Campus Station  
Rochester, NY 14627

Editor, Applied Mechanics Review  
Southwest Research Institute  
8500 Culebra Road  
San Antonio, TX 78228

Library and Information Services  
General Dynamics-CONVAIR  
P. O. Box 1128  
San Diego, CA 92112

Dr. R. Magnus  
General Dynamics-CONVAIR  
Kearny Mesa Plant  
P. O. Box 80847  
San Diego, CA 92138

Mr. T. Brundage  
Defense Advanced Research  
Projects Agency  
Research and Development  
Field Unit  
APO 146, Box 271  
San Francisco, CA 96246

Office of Naval Research  
San Francisco Area Office  
760 Market Street - Room 447  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Library  
The Rand Corporation  
1700 Main Street  
Santa Monica, CA 90401

Department Librarian  
University of Washington  
Department of Aeronautics and  
Astronautics  
Seattle, WA 98105

Dr. P. E. Rubbert  
Boeing Commercial Airplane Company  
P. O. Box 3707  
Seattle, WA 98124

Mr. R. Feldhuhn  
Naval Surface Weapons Center  
White Oak Laboratory  
Silver Spring, MD 20910

Dr. G. Heiche  
Naval Surface Weapons Center  
Mathematical Analysis Branch  
Silver Spring, MD 20910

Librarian  
Naval Surface Weapons Center  
White Oak Laboratory  
Silver Spring, MD 20910

Dr. J. M. Solomon  
Naval Surface Weapons Center  
White Oak Laboratory  
Silver Spring, MD 20910

Professor J. H. Ferziger  
Stanford University  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Stanford, CA 94305

Professor K. Karamcheti  
Stanford University  
Department of Aeronautics and  
Astronautics  
Stanford, CA 94305

Professor M. van Dyke  
Stanford University  
Department of Aeronautics and  
Astronautics  
Stanford, CA 94305

Page 7

Engineering Library  
McDonnell Douglas Corporation  
Department 218, Building 101  
P. O. Box 516  
St. Louis, MO 63166

Dr. R. J. Hakkinen  
McDonnell Douglas Corporation  
Department 222  
P. O. Box 516  
St. Louis, MO 63166

Dr. R. P. Heinisch  
Honeywell, Inc.  
Systems and Research Division -  
Aerospace Defense Group  
2345 Walnut Street  
St. Paul, MN 55113

Professor R. G. Stoner  
Arizona State University  
Department of Physics  
Tempe, AZ 85721

Dr. N. Malmuth  
Rockwell International  
Science Center  
1049 Camino Dos Rios  
P. O. Box 1085  
Thousand Oaks, CA 91360

Rockwell International  
Science Center  
1049 Camino Dos Rios  
P. O. Box 1085  
Thousand Oaks, CA 91360

The Library  
University of Toronto  
Institute of Aerospace Studies  
Toronto 5, Canada

Professor W. R. Sears  
University of Arizona  
Aerospace and Mechanical Engineering  
Tucson, AZ 85721

Professor A. R. Seebass  
University of Arizona  
Department of Aerospace and  
Mechanical Engineering  
Tucson, AZ 85721

Dr. S. M. Yen  
University of Illinois  
Coordinated Science Laboratory  
Urbana, IL 61801

Dr. K. T. Yen  
Code 3015  
Naval Air Development Center  
Warminster, PA 18974

Air Force Office of Scientific  
Research (SREM)  
Building 1410, Bolling AFB  
Washington, DC 20332

Chief of Research & Development  
Office of Chief of Staff  
Department of the Army  
Washington, DC 20310

Library of Congress  
Science and Technology Division  
Washington, DC 20540

Director of Research (Code RR)  
National Aeronautics and  
Space Administration  
600 Independence Avenue, SW  
Washington, DC 20546

Library  
National Bureau of Standards  
Washington, DC 20234

National Science Foundation  
Engineering Division  
1800 G Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20550

Mr. W. Koven (AIR 03E)  
Naval Air Systems Command  
Washington, DC 20361

Mr. R. Siewert (AIR 320D)  
Naval Air Systems Command  
Washington, DC 20361

Technical Library Division (AIR 604)  
Naval Air Systems Command  
Washington, DC 20361

Page 8

Code 2627  
Naval Research Laboratory  
Washington, DC 20375

SEA 03512  
Naval Sea Systems Command  
Washington, DC 20362

SEA 09G3  
Naval Sea Systems Command  
Washington, DC 20362

Dr. A. L. Slafkosky  
Scientific Advisor  
Commandant of the Marine Corps  
(Code AX)  
Washington, DC 20380

Director  
Weapons Systems Evaluation Group  
Washington, DC 20305

Dr. P. Baronti  
General Applied Science  
Laboratories, Inc.  
Merrick and Stewart Avenues  
Westbury, NY 11590

Bell Laboratories  
Whippany Road  
Whippany, NJ 07981

Chief of Aerodynamics  
AVCO Corporation  
Missile Systems Division  
201 Lowell Street  
Wilmington, MA 01887

Research Library  
AVCO Corporation  
Missile Systems Division  
201 Lowell Street  
Wilmington, MA 01887

AFAPL (APRC)  
AB  
Wright Patterson, AFB, OH 45433

Dr. Donald J. Harney  
AFFDL/FX  
Wright Patterson AFB, OH 45433